

APPENDIX 3

Analysis of the Observations on the Statutory Consultation and the Response of the Council to the observations

Appendix 3.1

Analysis and Responses to the Statutory Consultation Correspondence

Responses to the Statutory Consultation on the Proposal to Close Brithdir, Dinas Mawddwy, Ieuan Gwynedd and Machreth Schools and Establish a Multi-Site Area School on the Existing Sites of Brithdir and Dinas Mawddwy

65 written responses received:

- 51 Letters (1 Bilingual, 38 Welsh, 12 English)
- 13 E-mails (10 Welsh, 3 English)
- 1 Petition with 208 names (included in the responses to the Councillors)

Responses received from pupils, staff, governors and parents of Brithdir School, governors of Dinas Mawddwy Schools, staff, governors and parents of Ieuan Gwynedd School, staff, governors and parents of Machreth School, Diocese of Bangor Statutory Education Board, Welsh Language Board, Brithdir, Llanfachreth and Rhydymain Community Council in addition to other organisations and societies.

Observation code	Comments	Number of responses including the observation	Gwynedd Council's Response
1	Education		
1.1	Essential that Y Gader area offers rural education / The Area School will offer a valuable resource for the children of the area / The Proposal will strengthen education within the area / Strengthen the educational and community experiences of the pupils and improve environmental resources / The proposed development will ensure the future of rural education in the area.	5	During the discussions on developing these proposals, it became obvious that the area is keen to ensure rural education provision. One of the aims of this Proposal is to ensure rural education provision in the area.
1.2	The proposal will improve pupil numbers in every school year and extend the range of opportunities for pupils.	1	The size of classes in the four schools at present is on average 12, with a range in class numbers of between 4 and 27. The strategy adopted by the Council on 2nd April 2009 notes an aim to ensure classes of between 12-25 pupils. If the recommendations are realised class sizes in the Multi-

			Site Area School will on average be around 20. It is predicted that the average class size on the main school site will be around 25, whilst the class size on the second site will be around 12. If the Proposal is realised the Area School will have around 96 pupils, with approximately 73 pupils on the main site and around 23 on the Dinas Mawddwy site.
1.3	Fantastic learning environment at Ysgol Brithdir / Education at Ysgol Brithdir is of the highest standard	3	
1.4	Small rural schools are of environmental and social benefit to children. Unfortunately due to the financial climate it is not possible to finance a number of small schools therefore establishing one slightly bigger rural school is a realistic proposal / A small family orientated school helps children to settle quickly and learn better.	2	
1.5	Friends are an important part of school life and pupils look forward to making new friends / Good to have more children at the school to form netball, football and rugby teams and the be able to establish a choir for the Urdd Eisteddfod	1	The existing schools have many good features. It will be a challenge for the Governing Body/Head Teacher/school to develop on these features within the new system.
1.6	An important part of school is friends and pupils looking forward to creating new friends / Nice having more children in the school to make netball, football and rugby teams and being able to have a choir and the Urdd eisteddfod	1	
1.7	Hope that the character of Ysgol Brithdir will be retained in the area school / Having a happy and friendly atmosphere is all important	1	
1.8	Good teachers are vitally important in a school	1	
1.9	Special education – the consultation document noted that provision for children with disabilities is being offered at Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau. Is it therefore true that the option of a rural Welsh education will not be an available option for children with disabilities? Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd has been designated to cater for special needs pupils / Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd is the only school designated for SEN pupils and which conforms with the requirements of DDA, the site is more than adequate because the land is level / New	5	Some primary schools within secondary school catchment areas are selected to provide resources for children with special needs. Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd was designated in this area. Before this, pupils had to travel ex-county. The new Area School will be designed to conform with the Disability Rights Law 'D.D.A' and Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau will be denoted as the provider of special education for the area. It has already been recommended that a substantial investment be earmarked for upgrading and adapting Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau, therefore there will be expertise in the catchment area.

	<p>extension with therapy room, shower, disabled toilet, hoist and changing bed, and also outdoor teaching space / The extension gives the proposal the opportunity to integrate easily with the main stream / Disappointing that SEN provision is not included in the new development which aims at abolishing this rural option. What about the equal rights of these individuals and their families? Making special education provision available in a main stream school ensures that the pupils develop to be sensitive members of society and nurture a natural empathy.</p>																
1.10	<p>There is a very high standard of education at Ysgol Machreth / The pupils of Ysgol Machreth should not be denied education in their own village school / Closing Ysgol Machreth will have a negative effect on pupils' education / Estyn inspection results are evidence of this / Do not believe that the proposal is beneficial to the education or the welfare of the children.</p>	<p>The Authority has no concerns over the quality of education at the schools The latest Estyn inspection reports confirm this.</p>															
1.11	<p>As a rule, parents choose the school which offers the highest standard of education.</p>	<table border="1" data-bbox="619 129 831 1160"> <thead> <tr> <th data-bbox="619 936 738 1160">Date of the Inspection</th> <th data-bbox="619 734 738 936">Ysgol Brithdir</th> <th data-bbox="619 533 738 734">Ysgol Dinas Mawddwy</th> <th data-bbox="619 331 738 533">Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd</th> <th data-bbox="619 129 738 331">Ysgol Machreth</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td data-bbox="738 936 831 1160">January 2008</td> <td data-bbox="738 734 831 936">3 x Grade 1 4 x Grade 2</td> <td data-bbox="738 533 831 734">May 2010</td> <td data-bbox="738 331 831 533">February 2007</td> <td data-bbox="738 129 831 331">February 2010</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="738 936 831 1160">Details of Inspection Reports</td> <td data-bbox="738 734 831 936"></td> <td data-bbox="738 533 831 734">7 x Grade 2</td> <td data-bbox="738 331 831 533">1 x Grade 1 6 x Grade 2</td> <td data-bbox="738 129 831 331">5 x Grade 1 2 x Grade 2</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p data-bbox="831 719 855 1093">Table 9: Results of latest Estyn inspections</p> <p data-bbox="855 1048 879 1093">Key:</p> <p data-bbox="879 958 903 1093">Estyn results –</p> <p data-bbox="903 562 927 936">Grade 1 = good with outstanding features</p> <p data-bbox="927 434 951 936">Grade 2 = good features and no important shortcomings</p> <p data-bbox="927 105 1305 1167">The Authority is of the opinion the educational provision within this. Proposal would maintain and in some aspects improve the quality of the education offered to pupils attending the area school. There would be an opportunity for pupils to be taught in larger groups of peers, with more teachers being able to share and pass on their expertise. Indeed, when the time comes for staff to be appointed for the new organisation, it is part of the Authority's Alternative Employment Policy (dealing with school reorganisation proposals such as this one) to guarantee interviews to members of staff that are employed at the existing schools. The Authority predicts that the Governing Body of the new establishment will have a choice from among the best teaching and support staff to join the school team and continue to maintain high standards.</p>	Date of the Inspection	Ysgol Brithdir	Ysgol Dinas Mawddwy	Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd	Ysgol Machreth	January 2008	3 x Grade 1 4 x Grade 2	May 2010	February 2007	February 2010	Details of Inspection Reports		7 x Grade 2	1 x Grade 1 6 x Grade 2	5 x Grade 1 2 x Grade 2
Date of the Inspection	Ysgol Brithdir	Ysgol Dinas Mawddwy	Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd	Ysgol Machreth													
January 2008	3 x Grade 1 4 x Grade 2	May 2010	February 2007	February 2010													
Details of Inspection Reports		7 x Grade 2	1 x Grade 1 6 x Grade 2	5 x Grade 1 2 x Grade 2													
1.12	<p>There is nothing that prevents us from meeting the requirements for 21st Century education / Ysgol Machreth</p>	<p>The points in this comment are being discussed later on in this document under the relevant headings. The Authority agrees with the Estyn inspection conclusions referred</p>															

	<p>has a number of factors which you note as the basis for decision: Quality of the Teaching, Leadership an Staffing, Community and Language</p>		<p>to in this comment especially in terms of quality of the teaching/learning and the leadership. The proposal highlights that these same successful qualities will be in the proposed Area School.</p> <p>The Authority is of the opinion that the educational provision within this Proposal would maintain, and in some aspects, improve the quality of the education offered to pupils attending the area school. There would be an opportunity for pupils to be taught in larger groups of peers, with more teachers being able to share and pass on their expertise. Indeed, when the time comes for staff to be appointed for the new school, it is part of the Authority's Alternative Employment Policy (dealing with school reorganisation proposals such as this one) to guarantee interviews to members of staff at the existing schools. The Authority predicts that the Governing Body of the new establishment will have a choice from among the best teaching and support staff to join the school team and continue to maintain high standards.</p>
1.13	<p>Foundation phase and KS2 pupils combine with another school. Why cannot a similar arrangement to the one at Corris and Pennal be developed?</p>	1	<p>It is understood that an arrangement of close collaboration has been established between Ieuan Gwynedd and Machreth schools since presenting the proposal. The Council welcomes this arrangement within the transition period, especially as the numbers at the two schools are so low.</p> <p>Reference was made to the federalisation arrangement which has developed between Ysgol Corris and Ysgol Pennal. The situation in that area is different, where the federal arrangement is more likely to fulfil specific needs. There was a tradition of collaboration between the two schools and also the pupil numbers at the two schools were higher. But in the case of these two schools, the most obvious difference is the travelling distance that pupils would have to undertake to reach another school within the County. In this instance there were no other clear options which met with the Council's strategy.</p>
1.14	<p>There is a good standard of education at Llanfachreth and the school has received excellent reports from ESTYN / This standard will have to be maintained at the new school</p>	4	<p>The Council acknowledges that the standard of education in each one of the schools is very strong. This will be of great benefit to the Governing Body which will appoint staff for the proposed Area School.</p> <p>The Authority is of the opinion that the educational provision within this Proposal would maintain, and in some aspects, improve the quality of the education offered to pupils attending the area school. There would be an opportunity for pupils to be taught in larger groups of peers, with more teachers being able to share and pass on their expertise. Indeed, when the time comes for staff to be appointed for the new school, it</p>

		is part of the Authority's Alternative Employment Policy (dealing with school reorganisation proposals such as this one) to guarantee interviews to members of staff at the existing schools. The Authority predicts that the Governing Body of the new establishment will have a choice from among the best teaching and support staff to join the school team and continue to maintain high standards.	
1.15	Why offer a choice between rural and urban education provision for the children of the area but confine the choice for children with special needs? There is a new unit for pupils with special educational needs on the Rhydymain site already and it is also suitable for pupils in wheelchairs. These children already travel for over 25 minutes.	2	Continuing to offer the appropriate provision for pupils with special educational needs is an important feature of this Proposal. The resources and the expertise now available are already offered at Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau. Even so, the Council intends to make a substantial investment to further develop this aspect on the site at Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau (agreed at the meeting of the Full Council on 14/07/2011). A substantial development of this type – together with centralising expertise at that location - would be likely to maintain if not improve upon the provision currently being offered at Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd. For information, the unit would be able to receive pupils with disabilities (e.g. pupils in wheelchairs as stated in the observation)
1.16	Desire to have a school which will improve on the provision already available at Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd. Do not believe that the development at Brithdir will fulfil this desire whilst the features on the Rhydymain site are obviously stronger.	1	The area school will be constructed according to the requirements of 21 st Century education, and therefore its features will be superior to any found at present in any of the schools within the area. The evidence given by Estyn in its report “‘Appraisal of schools’ performance before and after moving into new premises or renovated building, 2007” points out that new buildings or upgraded buildings contribute significantly towards improving the quality of the teaching and learning. The Authority is of the opinion that the educational provision within this Proposal would maintain, and in some aspects, improve the quality of the education offered to pupils attending the area school. There would be an opportunity for pupils to be taught in larger groups of peers, with more teachers being able to share and pass on their expertise. Indeed, when the time comes for staff to be appointed for the new school, it is part of the Authority's Alternative Employment Policy (dealing with school reorganisation proposals such as this one) to guarantee interviews to members of staff at the existing schools. The Authority predicts that the Governing Body of the new establishment will have a choice from among the best teaching and support staff to join the school team and continue to maintain high standards.
1.17	No objection to the principle of establishing an area school	1	Throughout the consultation general support for the proposal of establishing an Area School was seen.
1.18	Small classes are beneficial to children's education.	3	A study of a range of evidence outlines the general opinion – confirmed in the policy by

		<p>the governing body – that classes of over 30 pupils are unacceptable for children under 7 years of age and undesirable for children of 7-11 years.</p> <p>Further to this, recent research suggests that classes can be too small. Peter Blatchford noted in his publication “The Class Size Debate: Is Small Better” “...it may also be worth considering that class sizes can be too small” and reported that teachers have suggested that “...the dynamics of the group could become flat and some children could dominate”.</p>	
1.19	Is there a presumption that an area school is successful in terms of educational results and pupil happiness?	1	There are many examples of successful area schools. However, many features combined together contribute towards the success or failure of a school and this involves effective teaching and learning, effective leadership and management, suitable resources and the curriculum. This is true in any school of any size and of any constitution.
2	Community		
2.1	There is a community spirit at Ysgol Brithdir and many people help with after school activities, clubs and money raising activities / The new school and site at Brithdir and Dinas Mawddwy will be a school with the same friendly, close-knit feeling that exists there already / Children now at Ysgol Brithdir work together to create positive experiences.	4	During discussions on developing these proposals, it became obvious that the area is keen to ensure rural educational provision. Rural schools have a role to play within their community. Being part of a supportive society enables schools to continue to be a key part of society.
2.2	Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd will continue to be part of the cultured Welsh society with a large number of movements which are very supportive of the school and through direct contact enrich the education of the pupils / The Rhydymain site is part of the village whilst the site at Brithdir is a mile from the village / What community use is foreseen at the school? / If the new school is located in Brithdir the staff would be very dependent on parents’ good will to transport their children / Strong contact between the school and the community in Rhydymain	6	In developing an area school in any location it is very important that support of this kind continues for the benefit of the school and the pupils. One of the main responsibilities and aims of the school, the head teacher, the governing body, the Authority and residents of the area will be to ensure that this kind of support continues for the benefit of the pupils and the school.
2.3	Small schools are central to the life of every community / Special measures have been identified to try and alleviate the negative effect on those communities where the schools close / Closing Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd would be a huge blow	4	The area school would have an opportunity to receive wider support from a wider area where many more organisations and individuals can support the education of the pupils.
			Government guidelines (Circular 021/2009 Schools Organisation Proposals) on the reorganisation of schools note factors which need to be considered when forming proposals for the reorganisation of schools. Information on the factors considered in the statistical analysis of the catchment area is available on the Council website . A

			<p>study of the possible effects of any of the various options on the community was commissioned from independent consultants as part of the process of developing proposals. Also, an assessment of the economic effects was commissioned concurrently with the community study. The reports can be viewed on the Council website and copies are available for scrutiny as noted in Appendix 4.</p>
2.4	<p>to the village and to the community.</p> <p>Closing Ysgol Brithdir would have a negative effect on the community, pleased that the site is being retained.</p>	1	<p>During the catchment area discussions an analysis of community use of every school and the contribution of the schools to their community was published in the statistical pack. Also listed were the resources found in each community (e.g. community centres, playing fields etc.)</p>
2.5	<p>Closing Ysgol Llanfachreth would kill the community /If Ysgol Machreth closes the community will disintegrate / Very strong feeling that the school should not be closed / the school, open evenings, social events, Christmas Shows, Concerts make the community and bring everyone together / Very sad time for parents, pupils, families and the community of Ysgol Machreth / Once the school is closed there will be no turning back. How will the community in Llanfachreth be able to attract young families? / Closing the school will be a huge blow for the community.</p>	9	<p>In looking at the assessment made of the possible effects of a number of the models initially considered, the community and economic assessments both noted the effects of different models. In short, the message was that, under any model, closing schools in the rural areas will have a negative effect – this meant that any model of an area school or lifelong model would have a similar effect. The only model that would not have a negative effect – but a neutral effect – would be a model of collaboration which in reality would mean that there would be no change in school presence within the individual villages.</p> <p>As specific models were developed – the assessment for the area school model was fine-tuned. It was noted that closing some schools as the area school was established would have a negative effect on the community and on the economy in those areas where school closure would occur. On the other hand, whilst acknowledging the disadvantage of moving pupils from the Dinas Mawddwy location on a regular basis, the initial assessment of models with satellites note that this type of model is less destructive than closing every rural site.</p> <p>For those communities where the school will close, the report recommends some measures for the Council to consider in order to alleviate the negative effect, for example:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensure support for those communities where the schools will close in order to maintain those communities. • Offer support for those communities so that they can consider the best use for the school building once the school is closed.

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Make plans to ensure that the area school includes the villages within the catchment of the school in activities and holds occasional events in those villages. • Offer a transport provision to help with the transport of pupils from the communities effectively and safely. • Endeavour to restrict the children's travelling time to the County target (30 minutes) and assess the satisfaction level of parents and pupils with the transport arrangements in terms of punctuality and safety. • Try and ensure transport provision which coincides with the ex-curriculum activities so that there will be less need for parents to fetch their children from school. <p>The Council will need to consider these alleviating measures if a decision is reached to implement the proposal.</p>	
2.6	There is a housing development in Rhydymain and some of the dwellings have been earmarked for people receiving support from Tai Clwyd to purchase them.		A planning application has been recommended for this number, but unfortunately, according to the information received, the response to the need has been low despite attempts to hold an open day to raise awareness. Two dwellings built in this area have been empty for at least two years.
2.7	Ysgol Glantwymyn is an Area School and five schools were closed in order to establish it in 1971 (with strong opposition). The villages which lost their schools are still alive and flourishing and some of them still hold competition meetings, Sunday School, whist drives etc. The communities pull together and support each other since the children attend one central school, namely Ysgol Glantwymyn		Reference is made here to an example of an area school in a neighbouring county. There have been instances in the past of a school being closed and yet the community has still flourishing. There will be an opportunity for the residents of the area, and indeed for the Governing Body of the school to develop a working relationship and to ensure that the school and the community each contribute towards the life of the other. Ysgol Dinas Mawddwy itself is an area school since other schools were closed when it was established. The communities of Lithfaen and Caeathro are two other examples within Gwynedd where schools were closed in the past but where the community vitality remains.
2.8	The needs of the communities is a fairer reflection of the situation than pupil numbers.		The Council Strategy takes into consideration community needs and pupil numbers alongside a number of other factors. It is appropriate for the Authority to consider these factors both separately and grouped together – some of the factors cannot be considered fairly in isolation if fair consideration is to be afforded to all factors.
2.9	How prominent is Ysgol Brithdir in local, regional and national events ? How much use is made of community resources by Ysgol Brithdir?		Prominent. In the latest Estyn inspection the school received grade 1, the highest possible grade (good with excellent features) in key question 3, namely 'How well do learning experiences meet with the needs and the interests of learners and the wider community'. The school is involved with a number of local, regional and national

		activities of various kinds. Estyn went on to state “the school provides an excellent variety of good quality experiences for pupils, including educational visits which coincide with seasonal themes, guest speakers, sports opportunities, music tuition, resident courses and opportunities for developing performing and creative skills in art and music as well as through competitions in the Urdd Eisteddfod” In addition the report notes excellence “(The pupils’) cultural development is further promoted by taking part in local projects. Through subjects such as religious instruction, geography, music, art and craft their knowledge and understanding of the world around them and other cultures is developed.” The report goes on to note excellence in the way the school makes good connections with other bodies at local, regional and national level.
3	Statistics / Finance	
3.1	Staffing protection for Brithdir is £6,109 whilst the protection for Rhydymain is £39,908. Protection for Rhydymain, Llanfachreth and Dinas Mawddwy totals £105,507 The cost per pupil is considerably lower in Brithdir than in the other three schools in question	2
3.2	The consultation document is not clear about the cost of the proposal, although the new area school is costed at around £3.8 million and the renovation and adaptation work on the other four schools costed at £2.3 million	1
3.3	There should be detailed figures to justify the cost of £1.65 million estimated for developing the Brithdir site and the	7
		In developing this proposal and discussing options at the CRP meetings, it was estimated that developing a brand new school would cost in the region of £3.8m. This option was considered, but a decision taken to develop one of the existing school sites because of the need to take swift action and find a solution in view of the vulnerable situation at the schools.

	<p>cost of £1.05 million estimated for developing the Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd site. Considering the land purchase and the work that needs to be completed, one would expect a greater difference between these figures / Rhydymain is on level ground and could easily be developed whilst Brithdir is on a slope and the site has many problems.</p>	<p>If the proposal is not implemented it is estimated that an expenditure would be needed to repair and adapt the buildings at Brithdir, Dinas Mawddwy, Ieuan Gwynedd and Machreth schools in order to improve the condition and suitability of the buildings. In implementing the proposal and closing the Machreth and Ieuan Gwynedd school sites, this expense would be reduced and an investment made in the site that will be developed as the main site for the area school in Brithdir.</p>																																																																																																																
3.4	<p>The development at Brithdir is much more costly than predicted and taxpayers will not get their money's worth. / Common sense notes that extra money should not be spent on a sub-standard site, especially in a difficult period of financial crisis / Will the figure for Brithdir be sufficient?</p>	<p>Adapting the site at Brithdir would cost around £1.65 million, which would include a brand new teaching and learning building, playing field, soft play area, new entrance and parking places, straightening the road outside the site, adapting the existing building to afford a hall, kitchen and staff rooms. The Council has already committed to financing this proposal.</p>																																																																																																																
3.5	<p>Capacity of the area school, Brithdir can accommodate 38 but there will be 78 pupils on the main site. Trying to explain the investment in additional places at Brithdir whilst retaining empty places at Dinas Mawddwy will call for very careful reasoning</p>	<p>The site will have to be planned to accommodate the number of pupils expected in September 2013 (78) with an additional 10% (in accordance with Welsh Government requirements). This will entail a school for 80-90 pupils. There will be no change to the capacity in Dinas Mawddwy.</p>																																																																																																																
3.6	<p>Numbers have been higher in Ysgol Machreth with 37 in 1997 – there is a ten year cycle and the situation can change.</p>	<p>Looking at the pattern since 1975, the numbers at Ysgol Llanfachreth have varied. The maximum number was 37 in 1997, and the minimum 11 in 1980.</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="853 134 1189 1153"> <thead> <tr> <th>School</th> <th>1975</th> <th>1980</th> <th>1985</th> <th>1990</th> <th>1995</th> <th>2000</th> <th>2005</th> <th>2010</th> <th>1975-2010 (change)</th> <th>1975-2010 (% change)</th> <th>2011</th> <th>1975-2011 (change)</th> <th>1975-2011 (% change)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Brithdir</td> <td>21</td> <td>18</td> <td>23</td> <td>24</td> <td>22</td> <td>43</td> <td>38</td> <td>40</td> <td>19</td> <td>90%</td> <td>45</td> <td>24</td> <td>114%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Dinas Mawddwy</td> <td>38</td> <td>43</td> <td>38</td> <td>52</td> <td>44</td> <td>37</td> <td>34</td> <td>25</td> <td>-13</td> <td>-34%</td> <td>22</td> <td>-16</td> <td>-42%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Ieuan Gwynedd</td> <td>31</td> <td>31</td> <td>32</td> <td>28</td> <td>24</td> <td>17</td> <td>26</td> <td>19</td> <td>-12</td> <td>-39%</td> <td>16</td> <td>-15</td> <td>-48%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Machreth</td> <td>17</td> <td>11</td> <td>18</td> <td>25</td> <td>32</td> <td>27</td> <td>26</td> <td>22</td> <td>5</td> <td>29%</td> <td>16</td> <td>-1</td> <td>-16%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Y Gader Catchment Area</td> <td>475</td> <td>458</td> <td>481</td> <td>459</td> <td>478</td> <td>436</td> <td>419</td> <td>386</td> <td>-89</td> <td>-19%</td> <td>Not available</td> <td>Not available</td> <td>Not available</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Meirionnydd</td> <td>3,293</td> <td>2,993</td> <td>2,567</td> <td>2,597</td> <td>2,774</td> <td>2,745</td> <td>2,510</td> <td>2,229</td> <td>-1,064</td> <td>-32%</td> <td>Not available</td> <td>Not available</td> <td>Not available</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Gwynedd</td> <td>12,084</td> <td>11,104</td> <td>9,505</td> <td>9,516</td> <td>10,321</td> <td>10,679</td> <td>10,150</td> <td>9,703</td> <td>-2,381</td> <td>-20%</td> <td>Not available</td> <td>Not available</td> <td>Not available</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	School	1975	1980	1985	1990	1995	2000	2005	2010	1975-2010 (change)	1975-2010 (% change)	2011	1975-2011 (change)	1975-2011 (% change)	Brithdir	21	18	23	24	22	43	38	40	19	90%	45	24	114%	Dinas Mawddwy	38	43	38	52	44	37	34	25	-13	-34%	22	-16	-42%	Ieuan Gwynedd	31	31	32	28	24	17	26	19	-12	-39%	16	-15	-48%	Machreth	17	11	18	25	32	27	26	22	5	29%	16	-1	-16%	Y Gader Catchment Area	475	458	481	459	478	436	419	386	-89	-19%	Not available	Not available	Not available	Meirionnydd	3,293	2,993	2,567	2,597	2,774	2,745	2,510	2,229	-1,064	-32%	Not available	Not available	Not available	Gwynedd	12,084	11,104	9,505	9,516	10,321	10,679	10,150	9,703	-2,381	-20%	Not available	Not available	Not available
School	1975	1980	1985	1990	1995	2000	2005	2010	1975-2010 (change)	1975-2010 (% change)	2011	1975-2011 (change)	1975-2011 (% change)																																																																																																					
Brithdir	21	18	23	24	22	43	38	40	19	90%	45	24	114%																																																																																																					
Dinas Mawddwy	38	43	38	52	44	37	34	25	-13	-34%	22	-16	-42%																																																																																																					
Ieuan Gwynedd	31	31	32	28	24	17	26	19	-12	-39%	16	-15	-48%																																																																																																					
Machreth	17	11	18	25	32	27	26	22	5	29%	16	-1	-16%																																																																																																					
Y Gader Catchment Area	475	458	481	459	478	436	419	386	-89	-19%	Not available	Not available	Not available																																																																																																					
Meirionnydd	3,293	2,993	2,567	2,597	2,774	2,745	2,510	2,229	-1,064	-32%	Not available	Not available	Not available																																																																																																					
Gwynedd	12,084	11,104	9,505	9,516	10,321	10,679	10,150	9,703	-2,381	-20%	Not available	Not available	Not available																																																																																																					
3.7	<p>Using the money invested in the Brithdir site to improve the existing sites and maintaining the collaboration model would be much more worthwhile.</p>	<p>Finance was one of the factors considered during the development stage of the proposal, but there are other factors such as education, reduction in pupil numbers and the modernisation of teaching provision have also been considered.</p>																																																																																																																
3.8	<p>Apart from the school, the residents of Llanfachreth do not receive any investment worth the mention.</p>	<p>The proposed area school will provide education for the Llanfachreth community and the neighbouring communities. It must be remembered of course that there is a large</p>																																																																																																																

3.9	<p>It was noted in the statutory consultation that 84% of the children live closer to the Ysgol Brithdir site than to the leuan Gwynedd site. This figure is not a true reflection since Dinas Mawddwy pupils have been included in this percentage / Where are the children's homes?</p>	4	<p>number of other rural communities within Gwynedd with no school.</p> <p>The Authority has conducted a detailed study of the current pupils' residence in the area in 2010 and again in 2011. A detailed picture of this was presented in the Catchment-area Review Panels.</p> <p>Dinas Mawddwy children have not been included in the figure 84%. Should Dinas Mawddwy numbers be included the figure would be 88% living nearer Brithdir than leuan Gwynedd.</p> <p>By using the latest data, namely the numbers in September 2011 it can be seen that 77 pupils attend the leuan Gwynedd, Brithdir a Machreth schools. Of these, 8 live within the Machreth catchment area and closer to the Brithdir site whilst 27 live within the Brithdir catchment area and 10 live within the leuan Gwynedd catchment. Of these, 25 live within the Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau catchment area which again is closer to Brithdir. Of the other 7, it is seen that 4 live in other locations which are closer to Brithdir and 2 live closer to leuan Gwynedd.</p> <p>Therefore 12 out of the 77 live closer to leuan Gwynedd and 65 live closer to Brithdir. 12/77 is 16%, and 65/77 is 84%.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Where Children in Eastern part of Y Gader live Sept 2011</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="879 338 1139 936"> <thead> <tr> <th>SCHOOL</th> <th>Total Children Sept 2011</th> <th>Llanfachreth</th> <th>Rhydymain</th> <th>Dinas Mawddwy</th> <th>Brithdir</th> <th>Dolgellau</th> <th>Other</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Machreth</td> <td>16</td> <td>7</td> <td>0</td> <td>0</td> <td>1</td> <td>7</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>leuan Gwynedd</td> <td>16</td> <td>0</td> <td>10</td> <td>0</td> <td>3</td> <td>0</td> <td>3</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Dinas Mawddwy</td> <td>22</td> <td>0</td> <td>0</td> <td>20</td> <td>0</td> <td>0</td> <td>2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Brithdir</td> <td>45</td> <td>1</td> <td>0</td> <td>0</td> <td>23</td> <td>17</td> <td>4</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total</td> <td>99</td> <td>8</td> <td>10</td> <td>20</td> <td>27</td> <td>24</td> <td>10</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <table border="1" data-bbox="1166 674 1278 936"> <thead> <tr> <th>Outside Catchment:</th> <th>Number</th> <th>%</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Machreth</td> <td>9</td> <td>56%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>leuan Gwynedd</td> <td>6</td> <td>38%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Dinas Mawddwy</td> <td>2</td> <td>9%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Brithdir</td> <td>22</td> <td>49%</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	SCHOOL	Total Children Sept 2011	Llanfachreth	Rhydymain	Dinas Mawddwy	Brithdir	Dolgellau	Other	Machreth	16	7	0	0	1	7	1	leuan Gwynedd	16	0	10	0	3	0	3	Dinas Mawddwy	22	0	0	20	0	0	2	Brithdir	45	1	0	0	23	17	4	Total	99	8	10	20	27	24	10	Outside Catchment:	Number	%	Machreth	9	56%	leuan Gwynedd	6	38%	Dinas Mawddwy	2	9%	Brithdir	22	49%
SCHOOL	Total Children Sept 2011	Llanfachreth	Rhydymain	Dinas Mawddwy	Brithdir	Dolgellau	Other																																																											
Machreth	16	7	0	0	1	7	1																																																											
leuan Gwynedd	16	0	10	0	3	0	3																																																											
Dinas Mawddwy	22	0	0	20	0	0	2																																																											
Brithdir	45	1	0	0	23	17	4																																																											
Total	99	8	10	20	27	24	10																																																											
Outside Catchment:	Number	%																																																																
Machreth	9	56%																																																																
leuan Gwynedd	6	38%																																																																
Dinas Mawddwy	2	9%																																																																
Brithdir	22	49%																																																																
3.10	<p>It is unreasonable that expense is being considered for developing the site at Ysgol Brithdir which is so close to the</p>	1	<p>The Ysgol Brithdir site is 2.9 miles from the existing site of Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau. Ysgol leuan Gwynedd site is 5.7 miles from the existing site of Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau.</p>																																																															

	site of the proposed Lifelong School in the town of Dolgellau																																															
3.11	40 children (around 40%) at the four schools are ex-catchment area pupils from Dolgellau and beyond.		99 children attend Ieuan Gwynedd, Machreth, Brithdir and Dinas Mawddwy schools. Of these, 8 live within the Machreth catchment area, 10 in the Ieuan Gwynedd catchment area, 27 in the Brithdir catchment area and 20 in the Dinas Mawddwy catchment area. 25 of the 99 live in Dolgellau, and 9 live further afield in places such as Arthog, Fairbourne, Talybont and Bala. This is 34% of the total number of pupils attending the catchment area schools that live outside the catchment areas.																																													
3.12	What is the teacher-pupil ratio in each school?		Teacher to pupil ratio as follows: Brithdir School = 21:1 Dinas Mawddwy School = 13:1 Ieuan Gwynedd School = 10:1 Machreth School = 11:1																																													
3.13	What are the forecasts for more children to attend the school?		Noted in the statutory consultation document, namely: Since 1975 the number of pupils at Ysgol Brithdir has increased by 114%, Ysgol Dinas Mawddwy has declined by 42%, Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd has declined by 48% and Ysgol Machreth has declined by 16%. Predictions do not show any change in the present trend:																																													
			<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>School</th> <th>True nos. Sept. 2008</th> <th>True nos. Sept. 2009</th> <th>True nos. Sept. 2010</th> <th>True nos. Sept. 2011</th> <th>Forecast September 2012</th> <th>Forecast September 2013</th> <th>Difference between Sept 2008 and Sept 2013</th> <th>Difference %</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Brithdir</td> <td>37</td> <td>37</td> <td>40</td> <td>45</td> <td>45</td> <td>46</td> <td>+9</td> <td>+24%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Dinas Mawddwy</td> <td>27</td> <td>24</td> <td>25</td> <td>22</td> <td>24</td> <td>20</td> <td>-7</td> <td>-26%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Ieuan Gwynedd</td> <td>25</td> <td>24</td> <td>19</td> <td>16</td> <td>18</td> <td>16</td> <td>-9</td> <td>-36%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Machreth</td> <td>29</td> <td>23</td> <td>22</td> <td>16</td> <td>15</td> <td>16</td> <td>-13</td> <td>-45%</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	School	True nos. Sept. 2008	True nos. Sept. 2009	True nos. Sept. 2010	True nos. Sept. 2011	Forecast September 2012	Forecast September 2013	Difference between Sept 2008 and Sept 2013	Difference %	Brithdir	37	37	40	45	45	46	+9	+24%	Dinas Mawddwy	27	24	25	22	24	20	-7	-26%	Ieuan Gwynedd	25	24	19	16	18	16	-9	-36%	Machreth	29	23	22	16	15	16	-13	-45%
School	True nos. Sept. 2008	True nos. Sept. 2009	True nos. Sept. 2010	True nos. Sept. 2011	Forecast September 2012	Forecast September 2013	Difference between Sept 2008 and Sept 2013	Difference %																																								
Brithdir	37	37	40	45	45	46	+9	+24%																																								
Dinas Mawddwy	27	24	25	22	24	20	-7	-26%																																								
Ieuan Gwynedd	25	24	19	16	18	16	-9	-36%																																								
Machreth	29	23	22	16	15	16	-13	-45%																																								
3.14	How many primary age children are there in the entire area?		There is a total of 383 primary children including nursery classes in Y Gader catchment area (346 without nursery).																																													
4	Quality and Suitability of the Buildings																																															

4.1	Looking forward to having more space in classes / Hope for open classes	2	When developing this proposal and discussing options at the CRP meetings, it was estimated that developing a brand new school would cost around £3.8m and that developing one of the existing sites would probably be a possibility and within the Council budget.
4.2	Hope that there will be a playing field, hall, playground and more play area in the new area school / Hope for green spaces and a garden for growing plants	2	
4.3	Following reorganisation this is a golden opportunity to develop a fit for purpose building in which to implement a modern 21st Century curriculum / A building which will suit the area, is attractive to the eye, meets its purpose exactly and makes full use of the technologies which reduce waste and are sustainable.	1	The reorganisation strategy notes that teaching and learning conditions are of key importance to providing education of the highest quality. The evidence given by Estyn in its report “‘ <i>Appraisal of schools’ performance before and after moving into new premises or renovated buildings</i> ”, 2007” confirms this view. The report notes that schools which have seen their buildings being renovated have seen an improvement in the attainment and achievement of their pupils. It is noted that Estyn reports on individual schools show that the quality of the teaching has improved, that attendance has been maintained and that behaviour has improved. It also notes that buildings which have been improved offer more choice, better educational provision and before and after school activities.
4.4	Disappointing that a brand new area school like the one at Bro Dysynni is not being offered / Hoped for a more ambitious plan but realise that there have been changes to the Government funding arrangements and that this is the only answer for this part of the catchment area	2	The Brithdir site will be developed and the classrooms will be newly built within a modern and environmental friendly building. It will provide a modern learning environment where all the latest technological facilities will be available. It is foreseen that the existing building will be upgraded and adapted to include a fit for purpose hall and dining room. Outside, it is foreseen that there will be a new car park and various play areas, including suitable playing field.
5	Transport and Travelling		
5.1	There will be no great increase in the number of vehicles travelling to Ysgol Brithdir since the mini bus will transport the children from Llanfachreth and Rhydyrnain i.e. school transport, this is in favour of Brithdir	4	Transport will be provided in accordance with the Council’s Transport Policy. If the proposal is implemented, provision will be made to ensure that there will be transport facilities for carrying pupils from the Rhydyrnain and Llanfachreth directions. At the moment, according to the present figures, it is predicted that two small buses will be needed to transport pupils from these areas.
5.2	By using the shortest route, Ysgol Ganolwyd is the nearest to Ysgol Machreth (3 miles) and then Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau (3.8 miles) but the road to Dolgellau is better than the road	1	Moving pupils from one site to another will be a matter for the Governing Body and the head teacher, but it is not predicted that this will happen on a regular basis.

	to Gantlwyd. The proposed site for the area school is 4.1 miles from Llanfachreth using the narrow back roads for most of the journey. To the site through Dolgellau is 6 miles. There is no certainty that the transport companies will recommend using the narrow back roads between Llanfachreth and Brithdir. Good practice suggests that the Authority should transport primary pupils as little as possible and not past other primary schools.		Welsh Government has a proposed plan which will involve improvements to this part of the road which will also improve the turning towards Brithdir from the Dinas Mawddwy direction, and there is a strong likelihood that this work will be completed by the time the school is developed.
5.3	Concerns regarding the roads between Llanfachreth and Brithdir, during hard winter weather the road can be very dangerous from the Bontnewydd and Dolgellau directions.	3	There are guidelines and policies in place to ensure that pupils are not placed in any danger when the weather is bad. A number of pupils across the County are transported to school along rural roads and their safety must be ensured at all times.
5.4	To reach the Brithdir site it is necessary to cross two narrow bridges and negotiate very sharp corners in the village and beyond.	1	A public bus service already makes use of this road and according to the opinion of the Highways Service the bridge is safe but traffic has to slow down to cross it because it is narrow.
5.5	Concern over safety in Brithdir. Picking up children and setting them down would be easier in leuan Gwynedd	1	Improvements will be carried out in order to ensure that children are picked up and set down safely on the Brithdir site. The most recent Estyn report for Brithdir school notes: “Pupil safety is well cared for. They are carefully supervised when arriving and leaving the school and during break times. Appropriate policies have been established to ensure the safety and well being of the children, which is implemented appropriately. Robust procedures are in place to undertake risk assessments when children are in the school and off site.”
			There is nothing to suggest that these robust arrangements cannot continue under the area school arrangement, as in the proposal.
6	Site Issues		
6.1	Brithdir		
6.1.1	In favour of the Brithdir / The reasons for choosing this site are completely clear, understandable and sensible / Ysgol Brithdir is in a pleasant setting out in the country and the school can take advantage of the natural elements, e.g.	16	The Council Board discussed the matter of the location of the main site at its meeting on October 11th, 2011, and debated whether to consult on the existing site at Ysgol Brithdir or the existing site at Ysgol leuan Gwynedd, Rhydymain. In balancing carefully the technical factors, other factors relevant to developing an area school, the

	nature walks, Torrent Walk, Roman fort.			observations of the CRP and of Local Members, it was recommended that consultation be held on the proposal to locate the area school on the existing site at Ysgol Brithdir.
6.1.2	Brithdir is the wisest choice because Rhydymain is too close to Llanuwchllyn / Brithdir is within easy reach for all concerned (Rhydymain, Llanfachreth and Brithdir) / 84% of the children in the three areas live closer to the Brithdir site than to Rhydymain / The new school should be viable for the future with certainty of pupils / Brithdir site offers sustainable rural education for the future / Parents choose Ysgol Brithdir because of the excellent Welsh provision and the education which gives young children confidence.	14		
6.1.3	Brithdir is within reasonable distance to the Dinas Mawddwy site / Rhydymain is further from Dinas Mawddwy and Llanfachreth / Proximity of Brithdir to Dinas Mawddwy is of key importance to the success of the development.	8		The distance between the Brithdir site and Dinas Mawddwy were noted as an advantage for locating the main site at Brithdir because this would facilitate the running of the multi-site area school.
6.1.4	The 'Top Torrent' road will have been improved by the time the new school is opened / Access to Brithdir (B4416) from the main road A470) is being improved and therefore an increase in traffic level will not pose a problem.	6		The turning from the A470 towards Brithdir will be improved as part of the Welsh Government scheme and it is likely that the work will be completed before the area school opens.
6.1.5	There is a suitable field adjacent to Ysgol Brithdir / The school will be kept off the main road and improvements will be made to the entrance.	3		A new entrance and parking area will be constructed at the school
6.1.6	The Seren Fach Nursery is located in Brithdir / Families are accustomed to travelling to Brithdir / Close contact exists between the school (primary education) and the nursery (nursery education) / Proximity of the nursery has attracted parents over the years, children attend the nursery and then it is a natural step for them to continue with their primary education in the village / Close contact is very important. / The Seren Fach Nursery is a success and in a convenient location for a large number of parents.	11		The proximity of the nursery provision was noted as a possible advantage for the site in the report to the Board on 11-10-11 and within the SWOT analyses by members of the CRP. Numerous letters received from consultees during the Statutory Consultation also noted this advantage.
6.1.7	45 pupils in Ysgol Brithdir / Numbers at Ysgol Brithdir have increased over the last few years and there are no empty places – increase of 114% / Numbers at Machreth, Ieuan Gwynedd and Dinas Mawddwy have declined (more empty	14		Since 1975 pupil numbers at Ysgol Brithdir have increased by 114%, Ysgol Dinas Mawddwy numbers have declined by 42%, Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd numbers have declined by 48% and Ysgol Machreth numbers have declined by 16%. Predictions for the schools do not show a change in the present trend:

School	True nos. Sept. 2008	True nos. Sept 2009	True nos. Sept 2010	True nos. Sept 2011	Forecast September 2012	Forecast September 2013	Difference between Sept 2008 and Sept 2013	Difference %
Brithdir	37	37	40	45	45	46	+9	+24%
Dinas Mawddwy	27	24	25	22	24	20	-7	-26%
Ieuan Gwynedd	25	24	19	16	18	16	-9	-36%
Machreth	29	23	22	16	15	16	-13	-45%

This is the table referred to:

School	Brithdir	Dinas Mawddwy	Ieuan Gwynedd	Machreth
Capacity (Based on National Assembly for Wales Memorandum No.2006 – Schools Capacity in Wales Bill) Together with Nursery Places Where Relevant	38	69	45	46
Age Range	3 - 11	3 - 11	3 - 11	3 - 11
Numbers on Register - September 2011 (together with nursery places where relevant)	45	22	16	16
% Change in Numbers at the Schools Since 1975-2011	+114%	-42%	-48%	-6%
Number of Pupils Forecast During the Next Five Years	2012-2013 = 45 2013-2014 = 46 2014-2015 = 46 2015-2016 = 46	2012-2013 = 24 2013-2014 = 20 2014-2015 = 20 2015-2016 = 20	2012-2013 = 16 2013-2014 = 18 2014-2015 = 16 2015-2016 = 16	2012-2013 = 15 2013-2014 = 16 2014-2015 = 13 2015-2016 = 13
School Category (community, voluntary aided, voluntary controlled, established)	Community	Community	Community	Voluntary Controlled
Category according to Language Medium (Based on National Assembly for Wales Memorandum No.2006 – Schools Capacity in Wales Bill) (DEFINITION: Schools According to Welsh Medium Provision) – WACC	Welsh Medium Primary School	Welsh Medium Primary School	Welsh Medium Primary School	Welsh Medium Primary School
Designated Religious Character (where applicable)	-	-	-	Church in Wales School
School Performance Data / Details of Estyn Inspection Reports	Inspection January 2008 3 x Grade 1 4 x Grade 2	Inspection May 2010 7 x Grade 2	Inspection February 2007 1 x Grade 1 6 x Grade 2	Inspection February 2010 5 x Grade 1 2 x Grade 2
Details of Any Additional Educational Needs Provision	-	-	Building adapted to take pupils with disabilities	-
Empty Places 2011-2012	0% (0)	68% (47)	64% (29)	65% (30)
Cost per Head 2011/2012	£3,910	£6,868	£7,519	£6,861
Pupils From Outside the Catchment Area 2010-2011	40% (16)	16% (4)	37% (7)	59% (13)

2

Brithdir is the most sustainable site, based on information gained from table 3.5 in the consultation document

6.1.8

In the statutory parents' meeting at Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd

6.1.9

As part of the adaptation work the road in front of the school site will be straightened

	attention was drawn to the fact that the proposed entrance for the area school in Brithdir is located on a blind corner (from the Brithdir direction). The plan would have to be adapted if the Brithdir site was confirmed.		in order to improve visibility from the entrance. Installation of traffic speed restriction methods are also under discussion.
6.1.10	Brithdir is unsuitable, dangerous for parents fetching and dropping off their children / Large vehicles become trapped on the bridge on the road leading to the school / Access to Brithdir from the A470	1	<p>The turning from the A470 to Brithdir will be improved as part of Welsh Government plans and it is likely that the work will be completed by the time the area school opens. At present, there are no plans to make changes to the bridge on that road. The school entrance and parking space will be constructed from new.</p> <p>The most recent Estyn report for Brithdir school notes: “Pupil safety is well cared for. They are carefully supervised when arriving and leaving the school and during break times. Appropriate policies have been established to ensure the safety and well being of the children, which is implemented appropriately. Robust procedures are in place to undertake risk assessments when children are in the school and off site.”</p> <p>There is nothing to suggest that these robust arrangements cannot continue under the area school arrangement, as in the proposal.</p>
6.1.11	It would be a mistake to establish the area school within 2 miles of Dolgellau	1	<p>The Ysgol Brithdir site is 2.9 miles from the existing site at Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau. The Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd site is 5.7 miles from the existing site at Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau. The site in Brithdir is very popular in the area – there are 45 pupils in a school with a capacity of 38.</p> <p>The Brithdir site is closer to Dinas Mawddwy than to Rhydymain. The distance between Brithdir and Dinas Mawddwy was noted as an advantage to locating the main site in Brithdir as it would facilitate the running of the Multi-site Area School.</p>
6.1.12	It would not be unreasonable to ask Dinas Mawddwy staff to travel the 4 extra miles to Rhydymain therefore the emphasis placed on the proximity of Brithdir to Dinas Mawddwy should be ignored	1	<p>A traffic assessment has been carried out and the result of the Assessment was that extending the education provision on the Brithdir site would not create traffic problems in the area.</p> <p>If there was an increase in traffic levels as a result of 2 caravan sites it is most likely that the greatest increase would occur during school holiday time, and therefore would not affect the area school site to any great extent.</p>
6.1.13	There are two caravan parks in Brithdir which means an increase in traffic	1	
6.1.14	We foresee that the level of traffic through Brithdir and past the school will increase as a result of the improvements that	2	<p>There is no evidence to support this view. The traffic assessment has been undertaken and the result of the Assessment was that extending the education provision on the</p>

	will be made to the A470 main road at the Maes yr Helmau junction		Brithdir site would not create traffic problems in the area.
6.1.15	The size of the parking area in the design is insufficient. The plan shows 18 parking spaces. This would be insufficient considering that a number of parents and taxis will need parking space to pick up and drop off the children. The parking space is much too small to meet the requirements of parents from the 4 areas. There will also be people visiting the new school for parents' evenings, concerts and such events.	1	Indeed, the improvements to the A470 will improve the main road between Dinas Mawddwy and Dolgellau – this specific road does not go past the site in Brithdir. At the moment there is only a conceptual and initial design, and the Authority will do everything in its power to ensure that all the needs of the school users are met. If this plan goes ahead, an User Group will be established to develop it further. Matters such as these will be essential to the 'User Group' to consider whilst recognising the school's requirements, when the time comes to design in detail. The User Group includes members of staff, governors, pupils, parents and community members and will be operational during the design process. These factors have already been considered in discussions on costs which are noted in the Statutory Consultation document.
6.1.16	The site for the new school at Brithdir is a wet field, on a slope with bog land at its base. There is a history of water collecting in the bottom corner of the field and substantial cost will have to be undertaken to prepare the site for development before the start of the construction work. Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd is on ideal level ground, and it would be easy to develop the existing site.	2	
6.1.17	There is a private dwelling on the school land with rights for the owners and their visitors and any other person to cross the school land at any time. This causes considerable concern, especially since child protection is at the top of the national agenda.	6	There is no evidence to prove that schools which are located close to dwellings present a risk in terms of child protection. Indeed, most schools throughout the County are located on sites where they are surrounded by houses. The same procedure of ensuring health and safety at school is expected to be carried out as it is today. It is likely that considerations of this nature would be emphasised when the school site is being developed. The most recent Estyn report for Brithdir school notes: "Pupil safety is well cared for. They are carefully supervised when arriving and leaving the school and during break times. Appropriate policies have been established to ensure the safety and well being of the children, which is implemented appropriately. Robust procedures are in place to undertake risk assessments when children are in the school and off site." There is nothing to suggest that these robust arrangements cannot continue under the area school arrangement, as in the proposal.

6.1.18	According to ROSPA a play area needs to be visible for those who are on duty, with no recesses or hidden areas. From the plans for the site it appears that the piecemeal nature of the play area does not conform with this / The playground is not sufficient for a wet weather break when the children cannot play on the field; neither does it allow enough space for the promotion of various physical activities vital for the health and wellbeing of the pupils.	2	At the moment there is only a conceptual and initial design, and the Authority will do everything in its power to ensure that all the needs of the school users are met. If this plan goes ahead a “User Group” will be established to develop it further. Matters like this will be a basis for the “User Group” to consider whilst considering the needs of the school when it comes to more detailed planning. The User Group will include members of staff, governors, pupils, parents and members of the community during the planning process
6.1.19	The building at Ysgol Brithdir is very old.	1	The area school will be constructed to meet the requirements of the 21 st Century, and therefore its features will be superior to those in any school in the area at present. Pupils will spend the majority of their time in the new part of the building and the older part of the school will be converted into hall, dining room and staff rooms – these rooms will also be upgraded.
6.1.20	The size of the outside hard play area in Brithdir is too small to accommodate 80+ children if everyone is using the yard at the same time.	1	The area school will be constructed to meet the requirements of the 21 st Century, and therefore its features will be superior to those in any school in the area at present. At the moment there is only a conceptual and initial design, and the Authority will do everything in its power to ensure that all the needs of the school users are met. Matters such as these would be of key importance to the User Group and it would consider them as it identifies the needs of the school when the time comes for much more detailed planning. The User Group includes members of staff, governors, pupils, parents and community members and will be operational during the design process.
6.1.21	Who owns the Brithdir site?	1	Gwynedd Council is the site owner. There is a covenant in the deeds which restricts the use as a site for a school. If the use as a school is terminated, permission would be required by the Charities Commission and from similar previous experience, any income would have to be earmarked for similar use i.e. maintaining a primary school. It is not impossible for the Council to sell the site therefore.
6.1.22	Developing the Brithdir site would not rob the community of a school because Ysgol Brithdir is located outside the village	1	The Authority believes that all the communities could support the new school and that the school could benefit from those wider communities that it serves. Some observations from members of the Catchment Area Review Panel during the discussions favoured a brand new building on a totally ‘neutral’ site. It must be remembered that – despite its existing geographical location Ysgol Brithdir has been over its capacity for a number of years and has seen an increase from year to year. This is contrary to the pattern at the other 3 schools.

6.1.23	Seeing the purpose built car park greatly alleviated my concerns / Good to see that work on the new entrance can go ahead without affecting Ysgol Brithdir as it is at present / Children's safety is all important and a safe entrance is essential / The safety arrangements for those children who receive bus transport to school will increase due to the increase in the number of cars fetching and dropping off children on the site at the same time.	6	As part of the development it is recommended that improvements be made to the school entrance as well as developing a suitable parking area. It is recommended that a new car park be developed and a new entrance built. These measures will keep vehicles taking pupils to school off the main road and there will be a safe path separating pedestrians and vehicles within the car park and leading to the school.
6.1.24	Will there be enough parking spaces in Brithdir? There is a big problem there now with parents having to arrive at different times to pick up their children from school. In Rhydymain there is room for at least 15 cars opposite the school.	4	These improvements will also improve visibility into the site. Also under consideration is the installation of speed restriction measures along the road outside the site. Matters of concern will be given priority consideration by the 'User Group' when it identifies the needs of the school when the time is right for planning and developing much more detailed designs. During the design process, the User Group will include members of staff, governors, pupils, parents and members of the community.
6.1.25	The Brithdir site is being developed between two dangerous corners. Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd is off the main road and the village itself has two access points which offer themselves for a one way system which would make the site even more safe. Ysgol Brithdir is on a busy road which many use as a fast route to avoid the outskirts of Dolgellau. National guidelines note a condition that a school entrance needs to have visibility of 70 metres in each direction, assuming that traffic is travelling at a speed of 30mph. This is not a practical possibility in Brithdir without substantial improvements to the road. If the speed was restricted to 20mph the visibility from the village side of Brithdir would still be below standard.	12	
6.1.26	Creating a new entrance for Ysgol Brithdir is unacceptable since there is no certainty that every driver will keep to the speed limit and this could add to the risk of accidents to vehicles taking children to school.	1	An appropriate car park will be provided and this should alleviate the risk of accidents. These measures and others will move vehicles which carry children to the school off the main road where a safe footpath separating pedestrians and vehicles within the car park will lead to the school. These improvements and others will improve visibility into the school site. Speed restrictions will also be considered on the road outside the school.

6.1.27	There is no reference in the design to a one way parking system to avoid any likelihood of accidents involving children and reversing cars. It would be quite possible to operate such a system in Rhydymain.	2	It is a conceptual design at present and the Authority will do everything in its power to ensure the safety of all who use the car park, be this by installing a one-way system or through any similar system.
6.1.28	<p>No pavement or street lighting outside Ysgol Brithdir. No safe footpath for children to walk from the school to the hall or the chapel.</p> <p>There is no safe footpath for children to walk from the school to the hall or the chapel. With increasing emphasis on allowing foundation phase pupils to spend time in the open air and being educated in the open air, it is a great disadvantage that there is no safe footpath. In Rhydymain, however, it is possible to walk from the school to the village hall using a variety of footpaths and pavement routes. The children would not be walking along a busy road and street lighting already exists.</p>	5	<p>As a result of the investment on the Ysgol Brithdir Site, improvements will be made to secure safety on the site.</p> <p>Ysgol Brithdir have made use of the hall and chapel for a number of years. There are safety measures to ensure of safety of children when on walking trips.</p> <p>Estyn in their last inspection report, as an excellent virtue, noted: “there are use of other venues, such as the village hall. All-school performances are held in the hall and church ”</p> <p>Regarding safety the report continues by noting:</p> <p>“Pupil safety is well cared for. They are carefully supervised when arriving and leaving the school and during break times. Appropriate policies have been established to ensure the safety and well being of the children, which is implemented appropriately. Robust procedures are in place to undertake risk assessments when children are in the school and off site.”</p> <p>There is nothing to suggest that these robust arrangements cannot continue under the area school arrangement, as in the proposal.</p> <p>Should there be a desire, grants are available through the Welsh Government scheme “Safe Paths in the Community” and it is possible to submit an application for funding from this scheme if the school would welcome such a proposal. In accordance with the Government guidelines, the Community Council, the school, the Authority and the community would need to submit a joint application for grant funding and confirm that constant use would be made of the path.</p>
6.2	Rhydymain		
6.2.1	In favour of Rhydymain / Request to look again at the	10	The Council Board considered the matter of the main site location at its meeting on

	location in order to ensure that the best, safest and most cost effective location is selected for the new area school		October 11th, 2011, and debated whether to consult on the existing site of Ysgol Brithdir or the existing site of Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd, Rhydymain.
6.2.2	If securing rural education is one consideration in the consultation, then parents would be willing to travel the few extra miles to Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd / There is a feeling that the proposed new school is a development for Dolgellau children.	1	In balancing carefully the technical factors, the other factors relevant to developing a new school, the observations of CRP members and the Local Members, it was recommended that a consultation be undertaken, based on the proposal to establish one site of the Area School on the existing site of Ysgol Brithdir.
6.2.3	Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd was purpose built in 1970 to serve the children of the Rhydymain, Llanfachreth, Brithdir and Ganllwyd. Ieuan Gwynedd site has not been given fair consideration. The condition of the building at Ieuan Gwynedd is of the highest standard. Purpose built extension for pupils with special needs.	4	When the Council Board considered the matter, it was acknowledged that developing the Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd site would be easier, but that developing the existing site of Ysgol Brithdir offered the best opportunity to ensure a sustainable and viable school for the future, for the following reasons: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Geographical location in terms of accessibility for the pupils within the catchment area of the area school. More than three quarters of pupils live closer to the Ysgol Brithdir site than to the Ieuan Gwynedd site. • Distance from the Dinas Mawddwy site in terms of travelling time for pupils and staff and the importance of this in terms of running the multi-site area school. • The viability of the school for the future. It seems that there has been a general tendency over the years for numbers to increase at Ysgol Brithdir, whilst numbers at Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd have declined over the same period. There could be a number of reasons for this but the location is noted as an obvious factor.
6.2.4	Kitchen has been renovated in the last 3 years. Received a grade 5 score in food hygiene	1	
6.2.5	Special education unit built lately with shower room, disabled toilet, and a classroom; also an entrance separate from the remainder of the school, and suitable for wheelchair users. The rest of the building is also suitable for wheelchair users.	1	
6.2.6	There is no archaeological, geographical or biodiversity factor which might hinder development at Rhydymain	1	Of course, any new development would be constructed to meet all known needs and would meet the requirements of DDA Legislation in full – these factors have been considered already in relation to the Brithdir site also within the costs noted in the statutory consultation document were discussed.
6.2.7	Rhydymain receives mains water and sewerage services, therefore there would be no additional cost in developing to accommodate more persons	1	These factors have been considered already in relation to the Brithdir site also within the costs noted in the statutory consultation document were discussed.
6.2.8	Aware that those parents who choose rural education for their children are more than willing to travel from Dolgellau to Rhydymain to secure it	1	In September 2011 there was one pupil in Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd who lived in Dolgellau, whilst there were 17 pupils at Ysgol Brithdir living in Dolgellau.
6.2.9	Since the capacity at Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd is greater than the capacity at Ysgol Brithdir the development cost would	1	The Capacity at Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd is 45, whilst the capacity at Ysgol Brithdir is 40. This is not a substantial difference.

6.2.10	<p>be substantially lower</p> <p>It states in the consultation document that 84% of the children live closer to Brithdir than to Rhydymain –this does not prove that the children would not be willing to travel to Rhydymain. If the 84% includes the children from the Dinas Mawddwy catchment area it is totally irrelevant / Who is to say that Rhydymain and Llanfachreth parents are willing to send their children to Brithdir?</p>	3	<p>Dinas Mawddwy children have not been included in the figure 84%. Should Dinas Mawddwy numbers be included the figure would be 88% living nearer Brithdir than leuan Gwynedd.</p> <p>According to information on pupil numbers, Ysgol Brithdir is the only school in the catchment area where the numbers have increased, this could be for a number of reasons. Although there are plenty of empty places in Ysgol leuan Gwynedd the same is not true, for whatever reasons, no ex-catchment area parents have taken their children to Rhydymain.</p> <p>It is hard to predict what decisions the parent will make but when planning a proposal such as this one, the current numbers must be used. The area school will be designed for 78 pupils plus an extra 10%. Parents might choose another school, this is true across the County.</p>
6.2.11	<p>It states in the consultation document that the distance from the Dinas Mawddwy site in terms of travelling time favours Brithdir – in the statutory meeting it was noted that children would very rarely have to travel from one site to the other and that on those rare occasions they would be taken by bus. It is not easy for buses to cross the narrow bridge between Brithdir and the A470 and more than likely they would travel through Bontnewydd. The AA Route planner shows the journey through Bontnewydd to be 14.5 miles (23 minutes) and the journey from Rhydymain to Dinas Mawddwy to be 15 miles (20 minutes). Since it will be the teachers who will travel the extra 4.1 miles this does not justify spending the extra £600,000 on adapting the Brithdir site. It is possible that some members of staff at the Dinas Mawddwy site will live closer to Rhydymain / It will not be easy for buses to cross the narrow bridge close to Ysgol Brithdir and it is possible that buses would have to follow a different route to reach Dinas Mawddwy – this would entail more travelling time.</p>	3	<p>Movement between sites is anticipated to happen on occasions. It will be a matter for the Governing Body to choose how to collaborate between sites and it is possible that only the staff will have to move from site to site.</p> <p>A public bus service uses the road over the bridge in question. This would enable pupils and staff on the Dinas Mawddwy site to go directly by bus to the Brithdir site (without going through Bontnewydd).</p> <p>The Authority cannot make any comment on, or consider the location of staff members' homes when it chooses the location for the area school. No member of staff for the proposed area school have been appointed yet.</p>

6.2.12	<p>In the document it states that there is nursery provision in Brithdir - Seren Fach Nursery is a private enterprise and it is not a nursery group or a Ti a Fi Group. In the hall at Rhydymain there is a Ti a Fi Group and some of the parents come from Brithdir. In the past parents have brought their children to the Nursery Group in Rhydymain since there was no such provision in Brithdir / The connection with nursery provision in Brithdir should not be considered because Seren Fach Nursery is a private business. It should be noted that there is a very strong Ti a Fi Group in Rhydymain and this will feed the Nursery Group in the near future / The connection between Ysgol Brithdir and Seren Fach is the same as that between Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd and Seren Fach – they carry children from both schools to their after school club for the same fee / There is no way of considering a private nursery since it is dependent on supply and demand from parents who can afford the provision.</p>	7	<p>At CRP meetings, members (cynrychiolaeth o bob ysgol – namely the Headteacher, Chair of Governors and Parent Governor) were given an opportunity to create a SWOT analysis – of the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats of the various sites. Within some of the SWOT analysis, different members raised the matter of the contact between the Brithdir site with the Seren Fach Nursery and noted this as a strength. No member noted the Nursery Group (Ti a Fi) as a similar strength for the Rhydymain site. That is the reason why this matter is mentioned in the CRP minutes and in several of the SWOT analyses.</p> <p>In the consultation document it is noted that nursery provision is available close to the existing site of Ysgol Brithdir and that the school works very closely with the providers there. There is no Nursery Group in Rhydymain.</p>
6.2.13	<p>In the consultation document it states that there has been a general tendency over the years towards an increase in pupil numbers at Brithdir whilst the numbers at Ieuan Gwynedd have shown a decline – this is not a sound basis for assuming that the parents in the area school catchment area would not be willing to send their children to Rhydymain.</p>	1	<p>The truth of the situation is that Brithdir numbers only have increased and this could be for a number of reasons. Although there are plenty of empty places in Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd, the same is not true and by now the number of pupils at the school is 16.</p>
6.2.14	<p>It was noted that technical factors, other factors, views of the CRP and observations by the Local Members would be considered when the choice of site was made. The Councillors in question did not consult with the residents of the Rhydymain area.</p>	5	<p>The views of the Local Members were minuted at a meeting of the Full Council on 14/07/2011 and at a Council Board meeting on 11/10/2011.</p>
6.2.15	<p>The Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd site is off the A494 and is a favourable site in hard weather – very rarely does the school have to close whilst the situation at Brithdir is very different.</p>	2	<p>The Welsh Government have guidelines that all schools in Wales have to act according to its recommendations regarding rough weather - ‘Closing schools – opening schools in exceptionally harsh weather’.</p>
6.2.16	<p>In contrast to Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd the site at Ysgol Brithdir is in the shade and often the ice does not melt there at all during the day in winter / Brithdir is in the shade for at</p>	8	<p>Based on information received from head teachers, between 1st September 2010 and 9th February 2011, Ysgol Brithdir was not closed at all and Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd was closed for one day. The winter of 2010/11 was the coldest in 31 years and since</p>

6.2.17	<p>least 3 months of the year – this is an important point to remember when discussing usage use of outdoor playing facilities</p> <p>The hall at Rhydymain contributes to the school life at Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd, and could also support the area school – within easy and safe walking distance to the site along a pavement whilst there is a need to walk along a busy road with no pavement to reach the village hall in Brithdir / It can be used to conduct physical education lessons (Ieuan Gwynedd and Machreth already share the use of the hall) / Disabled access and toilets in the hall / Suitable Stage and seating for an audience of 300 – the Ieuan Gwynedd Christmas Concert is always held there / Ti a Fi Group is held in the hall and there are plans for further collaboration between Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd and the community / Dolgellau Young Farmers Club meets every week in the hall / Clubs and societies use the school / There would be no high costs involved with using the hall – if the area school nominated two representatives to serve on the Hall Committee, the school could rent the buildings at very reasonable rates / Arrangements are in hand for Barnardos to hold classes in the hall to teach parenting and child rearing skills and preparation for starting school / A welcome was extended to visit the hall.</p>	7	<p>Brithdir school remained open, the Council is confident that it can continue in the same manner in the future.</p> <p>Of course, during hard weather when schools continue to open, there are strict guidelines to follow in order to ensure the health and safety of the pupils in accordance with the appropriate policies.</p> <p>Being able to take advantage of community resources like this would be very beneficial for pupils from wider areas who may not have had access to them in the past. An area school which services a slightly wider area could take advantage of many more community resources from different villages in order to make the most of what the communities can offer to the education and development of the pupils.</p> <p>Furthermore, from the independent study of the effect of this proposal on the communities in question, some measures were noted to be considered to alleviate the effect.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensure support for those communities where the schools will close in order to maintain those communities. • Offer support for those communities so that they can consider the best use for the school building once the school is closed. • Make plans to ensure that the area school includes the villages within the catchment of the school in activities and holds occasional events in those villages. • Offer a transport provision to help with the transport of pupils from the communities effectively and safely. • Endeavour to restrict the children's travelling time to the County target (30 minutes) and assess the satisfaction level of parents and pupils with the transport arrangements in terms of punctuality and safety. • Try and ensure transport provision which coincides with the ex-curriculum activities so that there will be less need for parents to fetch their children from school.
6.2.18	<p>In Rhydymain, there is a large village hall with seating capacity for around 300, among the best in Gwynedd, also an adequate car park, which is already in place and would not involve any additional cost.</p>	2	<p>Of course we do not foresee that this proposal will have any effect on the activities which already take place at Rhydymain village hall. The hope is that contact with the area school will strengthen the activities within the area as a whole.</p>

6.2.19	Will the educational and sport opportunities be as good in Brithdir as they are in Rhydyman? Impossible / Yard at Brithdir is confined and will be the same size when there are more pupils at the school	8	The area school will be constructed to meet the requirements of the 21 st Century, and therefore its features will be superior to those in any school in the area at present.
6.2.20	With the advent of the 2008 curriculum and the foundation phase aiming at developing research skills and learning through experience, Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd is the best site to offer this / Convenient for field work in the area with safe nature trails, woodland, chapel, safe pavement through the village and a river flowing close to the school. This would not be so easily available in Brithdir	2	At the moment there is only a conceptual and initial design, and the Authority will do everything in its power to ensure that all the needs of the school users are met.
6.2.21	Many of the main elements in the design for the new site at Brithdir already exist on the Ieuan Gwynedd site – nature corner, playing field and substantial hard playground, all on level land and easily extended. There is a convenient play corner for the foundation phase already established and substantial grant funding has been received to further develop the outdoor area.	3	<p>The re-organisation strategy note that educating and learning environment are crucial to the provision of the highest education standard. The evidence given by Estyn in its report “‘Appraisal of schools’ performance before and after moving into new premises or renovated building, 2007” points out that new buildings or upgraded buildings contribute significantly towards improving the quality of the teaching and learning. The report notes that schools which have seen their buildings being renovated have seen an improvement in the attainment and achievement of their pupils. It is noted that Estyn reports on individual schools show that the quality of the teaching has improved, that attendance has been maintained and that behaviour has improved. It also notes that buildings which have been improved offer more choice, better educational provision and before and after school activities.</p> <p>The Brithdir site will be developed and the classrooms will be newly built within a modern and environmental building. It will provide a modern learning environment where all the latest technological facilities will be available. It is foreseen that the existing building will be upgraded and adapted to include a fit for purpose hall and dining room.</p> <p>Outside, it is foreseen that there will be a new car park and various play areas, including suitable playing field and a nature corner. There are special local characteristics in the Brithdir area, such as Roman remains which can be utilised to benefit education of the pupils</p> <p>Matters such as these would be of key importance to the User Group and it would consider them as it identifies the needs of the school when the time comes for much more detailed planning. The User Group includes members of staff, governors, pupils, parents and community members and will be operational during the design process.</p> <p>These factors have already been discussed when the cost stated in the statutory</p>
6.2.22	Since the Brithdir site is uneven there would be considerable	1	

	cost involved to ensure easy access for the disabled – this already exists on the Ieuan Gwynedd site.		consultation document were put forward.
6.2.23	Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd was closed for one day only during the hard weather of winter 2010/11.	1	Based on information received from Headteachers, between 1 September 2010 and 9 February 2011, Brithdir school was not closed. Ieuan Gwynedd was shut for one day. The winter of 2010/11 was the coldest winter in 31 years, Brithdir school remained open, the Council is confident it would be able to continue to operate in the same manner in the future.
6.2.24	Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd is closer to the Urdd centre in Glan Llyn and the leisure centre in Bala – both locations include a swimming pool and gymnasium.	1	The distance from Rhydymain to Glan Llyn is 8.2 miles, whilst the distance from Brithdir to Glan Llyn is 11.7 miles. Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd is closer.
6.2.25	Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd is on the A494 – a road that receives priority for being kept clear in the winter. The emergency services could gain easy access in an emergency.	2	This is correct. The road past Ysgol Brithdir also receives the same service during the winter. There are no concerns over either schools regarding access for emergency services.
6.3	Llanfachreth		
6.3.1	Unfair that Llanfachreth is not given consideration as the main site / there is a field for sale close to the school / Machreth is a Church School	1	Initial consideration was given to the Ysgol Machreth site, but a factor that was considered in making the decision was the road network. Consideration was also given to the pattern of numbers in individual schools, the viability of various sites, density of where pupils live in relation to the viability of the school site. It was resolved to locate on another site since these factors and others were stronger at other locations.
6.3.2	It is argued that the road is unsuitable but this is not true because buses and lorries travel along it daily.	1	
6.3.3	The argument that Ysgol Machreth cannot be considered because the road is unsuitable is a very weak one. It is safe for all the buses and transport lorries coming to the site.	3	
6.3.4	Ysgol Machreth would have potential for reaping renewable energy	1	It is necessary to conform with environmental requirements when a school is being developed on any site. Any opportunities to generate renewable energy would be considered when developing a new school. This is not the only factor that would decide on the location of a school.
6.3.5	Consideration should have been given to locating the school on neutral ground – it would have been fairer for everyone.	1	In developing this proposal and discussing options at the CRP meetings, it was estimated that developing a brand new school would cost in the region of £3.8m. This option was considered, but a decision taken to develop one of the existing school sites because of the need to take swift action and find a solution in view of the vulnerable situation at the schools.
			Obtaining planning permission on a new site would be very difficult in this area – since it

			is within the National Park. It was decided that it would be appropriate and in this case more cost effective to develop the site of an existing school.
6.4	Dinas Mawddwy		
6.4.1	Concern that the Dinas Mawddwy site is isolated, no great reason for its existence. Need for clear guidelines to be in place to ensure that the best use is made of the resources on the site, to prove that it is an equal partner in the multi-site development. The new Governing Body needs clear and practical guidance in developing the new multi-site school.	2	In developing the proposals, it was considered that Ysgol Dinas Mawddwy is already an area school, providing education for a wide area. Consideration was also given to the fact that the existing location of Ysgol Dinas Mawddwy is a fair distance from the other locations, over 8 miles from the nearest location in Gwynedd. Also considered was the travelling time for some Dinas Mawddwy pupils from their homes since some already travel up to 25 minutes to school.
6.4.2	Need to ensure that the Dinas Mawddwy site will not be a 'little sister' to the Brithdir site.	1	It will be the responsibility of the Governing Body and the head teacher to ensure that the same provision and the same standard of education is available on both sites.
6.4.3	Pleased that Dinas Mawddwy will stay – closing Dinas Mawddwy would entail losing pupils over the border to Powys, Y Gader catchment area needs the children.	1	The role of school governing bodies is determined by law and the authority cannot implement powers over such matters which have been highlighted in the statutory consultation document. The Authority would give its usual support to any governing body as is usual as the body implements statutory obligations
7	The Welsh Language		
7.1	An assessment of the linguistic effect shows that the proposal is likely to have a positive effect on the Welsh language / Pleased that the proposal will have a positive effect / Hope that people will support the proposal in order to ensure a healthy and lively future for the language in this part of Meirionnydd / Bringing children together will strengthen the social and informal use of the Welsh language.	4	An analysis of the linguistic background of every school was submitted, based on information gathered when the full statistics pack was prepared. An opportunity was afforded to challenge the evidence, and this was done by some during the catchment area discussions. Following this, the analysis was agreed upon. In developing the proposals for the catchment area, consideration was given to drawing together schools of similar linguistic backgrounds.
7.2	Ysgol Brithdir improves the standard of Welsh among pupils of non-Welsh parentage in a very short time.	1	An Assessment of the Linguistic Effect of the various models considered for the catchment area was commissioned when this proposal was developed. This was undertaken in accordance with the requirements of Welsh Government in <i>Circular 021/2009</i> . The full report is published on the Council website. In terms of this proposal to establish the area school, the Linguistic Assessment notes that establishing this model would have a positive effect on the Welsh language.
7.3	The Welsh language is excellent in Ysgol Machreth considering that it is the second language for some children / closing Machreth will have a negative effect on the Welsh language in Llanfachreth	2	

7.4	We are concerned that the education will not remain Welsh and rural because of the attraction of the new building in Brithdir for the town children.		<p>During the consultation, concern was expressed by some that closing some of the schools would have a negative effect on the Welsh language.</p> <p>The assessment score allocated to a rural area school (Brithdir, Machreth and leuan Gwynedd) on one site and Dinas Mawddwy pupils on the other site is +6 Positive. It is noted that there is healthy social use of the Welsh language at each of the schools – especially the three schools which will merge together on one site. It was also noted that the proposal could be a means of strengthening the Welsh language. The assessment reaches a conclusion that an area school could be a means of strengthening the Welsh language and that in a larger organisation it could develop into a positive linguistic powerhouse.</p>
7.5	Concern that closing the school would be detrimental to the Welsh language in the Llanfachreth area		A number of rural communities are facing this situation. In terms of education, the linguistic impact assessment notes that establishing the area school will have a positive effect. There will be a challenge for the community and the Governing Body to ensure that the school plays a key role in ensuring the future of the language in the area.
7.6	Is there a presumption that the main direction will be through the medium of Welsh?		Yes – following the guidance of the Authority's language policy
8	Provision of 'Church' Schools		
8.1	Church education is available at Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau for those parents and pupils who desire it after the closure of Ysgol Machreth (although the document does not note the views of the Diocesan Authorities on these proposals)		<p>In accordance with the statutory consultation process, the Diocese has presented its views on the proposal to the Authority.</p> <p>The Diocese notes that they are very eager for a Church provision to continue in Y Gader catchment area.</p>
8.2	<p>There are two Church of Wales schools within Y Gader catchment area, Ysgol Machreth and Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau which provide 43% of the primary capacity (reception to year 6) in Ysgol Y Gader catchment area</p> <p>By splitting the catchment area reorganisation into three parts – although the Diocese understands the reasoning – the Authority has split the existing denominational provision. The Diocese must respond to Statutory Notices based on</p>		<p>The two schools provide primary capacity of 43% for Y Gader catchment area, (namely the number of places which are available at the schools), even so, as a % of use made of the schools they also contribute towards around 40% of all empty places within the catchment area.</p> <p>When the time comes for making a decision on education organisation in Dolgellau consideration must be given to the results of this consultation before a decision is reached. Separate from this proposal, the Authority and the Diocese are still working together and discussing the possible options for education in the town of Dolgellau.</p>

	<p>definite situations, dependent on discussions during the next few weeks in the town. It is possible that the Diocese will have to respond negatively to the Statutory Notices based on this proposal. In accordance with the spirit of collaboration the Diocese does not want to have to do this. It would be very useful for the Diocese if the details regarding the proposed Lifelong School in Dolgellau were resolved before the Statutory Notices resulting from this proposal were issued. It is possible that community status will be given to the Lifelong School and with the closure of Ysgol Machreth this would mean that denominational provision in Y Gader catchment area would cease – the Authority is aware that the Diocese would strongly oppose this.</p>	<p>By following the guidelines of Circular 021/2009 a balance of provision and demand for education with a religious character within the catchment area, as part of any process regarding re-organisation of the provision in Dolgellau town (i.e. Dolgellau Primary School and Y Gader Secondary School). None the less, this consultation involves the education provision of these four schools, the current situation in the schools has lead to this proposal in the statutory consultation documents.</p>	
8.3	<p>The Diocese has provided education for the village and parish of Llanfachreth since 1847 – since the other school is so close the Diocese can see no reason to bring this provision to an end if Ysgol Machreth closes.</p>	<p>The Council acknowledges the need to continue with the discussions which are being held in the town and that consideration should be given to the need to maintain Church provision within the area.</p> <p>When the time comes to make a decision on education organisation in Dolgellau, the results of the consultation must be discussed before a decision is made. This consultation recognises that the provision in Ysgol machreth (be it either church or other) is unsustainable. Consultation is sought therefore on a proposal that addresses the fact that the school is unsustainable. Identifying and satisfying the demand for ‘church’ provision will be an important consideration regarding provision at Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau.</p> <p>Apart from this proposal, the Authority and the Diocese are still working together and discussing the possible options for education in the town of Dolgellau.</p>	
8.4	<p>Section 50 of the recent report on Ysgol Machreth suggests that there is a demand for a Church School in the area.</p>	<p>Although there is no specific part that highlights the need for a Church provision in the area, the Section 50 Report by the Diocese of Bangor reveals clear support to the school by parents and the community. The school received this report in February 2010.</p>	
8.5	<p>If a parent wishes to send children to a rural Church in Wales school, Dolgellau is not a viable option.</p>	<p>In accordance with the guidelines in the Circular 029/2009 Schools Organisation the Authority has considered consultation on the proposal to close Ysgol Machreth (which has a denoted religious feature) within its strategy <i>Primary Education of Best Quality for</i></p>	

			<p><i>the Children of Gwynedd.</i></p> <p>When discussing the guidelines in the Circular 029/2009 (part 1.25) which states “In some areas it is possible that it will not be compatible with cost effective provision to maintain religious schools” – the Authority agrees with the statement by the Bangor Diocese which notes “On account of the present numbers, the Diocese realises that Ysgol Machreth is unsustainable for a number of reasons”</p> <p>There are 2 ‘church’ schools in the area within 3.8 miles of each other. Ysgol machreth is very fragile with only 16 pupils on the register. In Dolgellau the church school there is much more sustainable with 149 pupils on the register.</p> <p>School provision with a religious feature is a choice at Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau. If the choice of receiving rural education outweighed this, then the parent’s choice of the proposed area school will be a consideration. In this unique case where a parent wants a combination of both i.e. ‘Church in Wales rural school’ the proposal under consultation will not fulfil that wish.</p>
8.6	Concern that there would be no rural Church School in the area and it should be ensured that discussions regarding this are held in the town	4	<p>The Council acknowledges that the discussions which are being held in the town need to be continued, and that consideration should be given to the need for maintaining Church provision within the area.</p> <p>When the time comes to make a decision on education organisation in Dolgellau the results of this consultation must be considered before a decision is reached. This consultation recognises that the provision in Ysgol machreth (be it either church or other) is unsustainable. Consultation is sought therefore on a proposal that addresses the fact that the school is unsustainable. Identifying and satisfying the demand for ‘church’ provision will be an important consideration regarding provision at Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau.</p> <p>Apart from this proposal, the Authority and the Diocese are still working together and discussing the possible options for education in the town of Dolgellau.</p>
9			
Statutory Consultation Process			

9.1	The Diocese welcomes the good working relationship that has developed as part of the process and looks forward to developing it further when the time comes for reorganisation in other catchment areas.		
9.2	Having had an opportunity to see the possible designs and plans at the statutory meeting, many of our questions have been answered positively and fully – plenty of play area planned which shows that you are serious about the plan.		
9.3	Disappointed that this is the first time for residents of the area to obtain official information regarding the proposed reorganisation and no opportunity was afforded to put forward our views before the Council Board issued the proposal. It was sad to read about the proposal in the press.		<p>Y Gader CRP was established during April 2010. The first meeting of the Panel was held on 29th April 2010. Five further meetings were held on 13th May 2010, 25th May 2010, 6th July 2010, 25th May 2011 and 13th June 2011.</p> <p>At the start of the process, a visit was held to every school in the catchment area by the Education Portfolio Holder and a representative of the County Consultative Panel. The purpose of the visit was to meet head teachers and to see and understand the situation at individual schools.</p> <p>One circle of meetings was held with individual schools during the process, during the period between 7th June and 23rd June 2010. An open invitation was extended to staff, governors and parents to attend separate meetings. These offered an opportunity to discuss general matters including the specific models in question</p> <p>Newsletters were prepared for circulation to every school during the catchment area discussions. Hard copies were sent to the schools to be distributed to every parent, the newsletter was e-mailed to every school and the newsletters were posted on the Council website.</p> <p>All the CRP papers were published on the Council website.</p> <p>Contact details for the officers involved with the work were placed on the website.</p> <p>A report was submitted to the Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee, the Council Board and the Full Council, outlining the direction of the local and democratic discussion regarding the proposed reorganisation process in the area. Discussions on reorganisation in the area were started as long ago as April 2010.</p>

			<p>This is the official period for views on the proposal to be expressed – namely the Statutory Consultation period. Often, when the statutory consultation papers are issued, the press publishes their contents, often within days. The schools and the other statutory bodies which have to be consulted received these papers the day before the consultation period officially started.</p>
9.4	<p>The existing site at Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd has not received fair consideration and there are some misleading observations in the consultation document</p>		<p>The Authority does not believe that the consultation document includes misleading comments. The site at Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd has been given the same consideration as the Brithdir site through the same procedure. It should be borne in mind that it is the full and unchanged observations from the SWOT analysis by the CRP that are quoted in the consultation document and that it summarises the views of local residents and others, not the views of the Authority alone.</p> <p>The Council Board considered the matter of the main site at its meeting on October 11th, 2011, and debated whether to consult on the existing site of Ysgol Brithdir or the existing site at Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd, Rhydymain. In balancing the technical factors, the other relevant factors in relation to developing an area school, observations of the CRP and the Local Members, it was recommended the consultation should go ahead on the proposal to establish one of the area school sites on the Ysgol Brithdir site.</p>
9.5	<p>The consultation document is very thorough and gives much detailed information</p>		<p>[REDACTED]</p>
9.6	<p>The first statutory consultation included a Diocesan Education Authority with a Voluntary Controlled Church School – a new experience for the Diocese and the Local Authority</p>		<p>The Council has held a statutory consultation on the inclusion of a Voluntary Controlled Church School during the last year. The Council has recent experience of consulting under circumstances of this kind - for example in the Bala area. In that instance St Asaph diocese were collaborating with the Authority.</p> <p>The Authority's officers have collaborated closely with representatives of the Diocese (Director of Education - Bangor Diocese) throughout the process as noted in 9.1</p>
9.7	<p>The Diocese did not receive an official notice from the Authority regarding the dates of the consultation and the Diocese did not have an opportunity to review, offer observations or discuss the consultation before the Authority published it. This does not conform with the Diocese's understanding of Welsh Government guidelines</p>		<p>A copy of the statutory consultation document and an official, clearly dated letter was sent to Bangor Diocese (Education Officer of the Diocese) in advance of the consultation period in accordance with the Council's statutory duties.</p> <p>Part 1.25 of Circular 029/2009 from the Assembly states: <i>1.25 In making decisions on closing schools with a designated religious feature, those who</i></p>

	<p>(021-2009, para 1.25) or with the spirit of the document <i>Faith in Education</i>.</p>	<p>present the proposals should consider the effect on the balance of the provision in schools with that feature and schools which do not have that feature. In some areas it is possible that it will not be compatible with cost effective provision to maintain religious schools as well as non-religious schools, but proposals to change the balance of the provision have to be dealt with in a sensitive way and the proposals should reflect the balance if possible.</p> <p>Since the start of the discussions at local level representatives from the Diocese have taken a full part in the process and were able to contribute views and concerns through the CRPs.. It was possible for a full input to be given on the development of the proposal during any of the meetings and to raise concerns as is customary in an open and local environment.</p> <p>Regarding the point: <i>The Diocese did not have an opportunity to review, offer comments or discuss the consultation document before it was issued by the Authority.</i></p> <p>Bangor Diocese is one of the bodies with which the Authority was obliged to consult regarding this proposal. It would not be appropriate therefore for the Diocese to influence the contents of the proposal since it is the Authority that issued it. It would not be appropriate for those being consulted to influence the contents of the document.</p> <p>The Diocese representative received the statutory consultation document and the background documents at the same time as other consultees and one month was allowed to respond to the statutory period.</p>
98	<p>The Diocese believes that the consultation document gives an insufficient analysis of the religious character of Ysgol Machreth and its preservation or loss in the proposals. The correct heading is not used either – religious status is not the same as religious character (a voluntary school does not have to have a religious character although most do). This section should state something about the educational partnership between the Church and the State and show clearly the commitment of the Authority and the Diocese to this partnership.</p>	<p>In developing the consultation document, the Council has followed national guidelines in accordance with Circular 029/2009 and the Schools Standards and Framework Legislation of 1998.</p> <p>In order to obtain the views of all interested parties the Council has included the religious feature of Ysgol Machreth in the statutory consultation document , in parts 3.4; 3.5; 5.1 ; and 7.3.3. Also, in order to obtain the views of parents, staff and governing bodies at every school included in the proposal the matter has been raised as a specific discussion point at meetings at every one of those schools.</p>

		<p>In accordance with those guidelines the Authority has included consultation on the proposal to close Ysgol Machreth (a school with designated religious feature) within its strategy <i>Primary Education of the Highest Quality for the Children of Gwynedd</i>.</p> <p>In considering the guidelines of Circular 029/2009 (part 1.25) which states “<i>In some areas it is possible that it will not be compatible with a cost effective provision to maintain religious schools</i>” – the Authority agrees with the statement by Bangor Diocese which notes “<i>Due to present numbers, the Diocese realises that Ysgol Machreth is unsustainable for a number of reasons</i>”.</p> <p>In considering the call for a religious educational provision in accordance with part 1.23 of the Circular, the Authority (within its strategy) has discussed the fact that the number of empty places in the religious schools (Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau and Ysgol Machreth) is 79. This represents 40% of all the empty places within Y Gader catchment area.</p> <p>It should be noted that the Authority has received no specific applications for places at Ysgol Machreth on the basis that they are religious schools.</p> <p>During the consultation process three parents raised the matter (twice by letter and once at a meeting for parents at Ysgol Machreth). The matter was also raised by the basic Governing Body (Church in Wales) and a letter was received from them.</p>
9.9	Paragraph 5.1.1.2 is totally unacceptable for the Diocese - using the words ‘is present’ leads people to think that denominational provision will continue in Dolgellau – which, as things stand, is uncertain.	<p>Point 5.1.1.2 in the statutory consultation document reads as follows: <i>“5.1.1.2 In the catchment area at present, Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau offers Church provision. This means that Church provision would be available within Y Gader catchment area for pupils/parents who wish to choose denominational education.”</i></p> <p>Since no decision has been taken on the situation in Dolgellau paragraph 5.1.1.2 refers to the situation as was known at the time of the consultation – namely the present.</p>
9.10	The inclusion of ‘Legal Status’ in paragraph 5.3.1 suggests that the Authority considers that Church School provision is not important since it notes in 5.1.1.3 that the Area School would be a community school with no church status	<p>Point 5.3.1 in the statutory consultation document reads as follows: “5.3 Why Recommend an Area School? 5.3.1 It is recommended that an area school be established in this part of the catchment area</p>

after considering a number of factors, including:

- Class sizes
- Pupil numbers
- Environment and quality of teaching
- Leadership and staffing
- The Community
- The Welsh Language
- Financial Resources
- Legal Status
- Geographical Factors
- Suitability of buildings

These and other factors are discussed in the remainder of the document”.

Point 5.1.1.3 in the statutory consultation document reads as follows:

“5.1.1.3 The existing catchment area of Ysgol Machreth will become part of the new area school catchment area if this proposal is implemented..”


Legal status (i.e. community school or voluntary) and the Church provision has been, and continues to be, one of the main considerations associated with presenting this proposal. The Authority is very keen to consult on this point and therefore it is a prominent factor in the consultation document so that the views of local residents and others are obtained (see above response).

Although, of the 4 schools in the consultation, 84% of existing pupils attend community schools, the Authority still considers Church provision as an important factor. No concerns were raised by local CRP members regarding Church provision or the effect of any proposals on that provision. During statutory consultation meetings at the schools (with staff, governing bodies and parents of the 4 schools) the matter was raised in Ysgol Llanfachreth by foundation governor (representative of the Church of Wales):

It was mentioned that Church provision is available at Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau but discussions are being held on establishing a Lifelong School. What about the future? Is there any certainty that Church provision will continue? The consultation document states that the provision is there now but there is no mention of the future.

			<p>Discussions are ongoing on the arrangements for the town of Dolgellau, and there is no way of predicting the results of the discussions. The Bangor Diocese representative agreed that discussions were being held and that he was part of those discussions. He added that he was confident that there will be Church provision in Dolgellau at the end of the process.</p> <p>Also the following point was raised at the meeting for parents at Llanfachreth: <i>The area school will not be a Church in Wales school and the provision will be lost.</i></p> <p>Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau will provide Church education in the area. The Council's language policy is operational at Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau as in every school throughout the County.</p>
9.11	<p>The Diocese believes that it would have been appropriate for the Authority to propose a meeting with the Diocese – its Bishop, its Statutory Education Board and its Diocesan Trustees, in order to give the Diocese an opportunity to voice its concerns and discuss them with the Authority</p>	1	<p>The Authority is very willing to discuss with the Diocese at every opportunity. Although no official request has been received from the Diocese during the CRP period or within the statutory consultation period the Authority would have responded positively to the invitation.</p> <p>In accordance with the guidelines in Circular 029/2009 the authority is not obliged to hold this type of consultation and the recognised and statutory process (namely this statutory consultation process) is utilised so that every individual and organisation has a fair opportunity of consulting on the proposal.</p> <p>However, throughout the process, the Authority has collaborated very closely with the Diocese representative (Director of Education of the Diocese).</p> <p>Since the start of the discussions (PAD) a representative of the Church in Wales from the Bangor Diocese has taken a full part in the discussions in the catchment area. As a Panel representative, one of the main responsibilities (as with other members) is to report back to the relevant persons on the discussions held at the meetings. Every representative was invited to raise points and to contact the Authority during every stage of the process if they needed any further information.</p> <p>It would be possible to consider an application from a body that had to be contacted in accordance with the usual procedure and within the guidelines of Circular 029/2009.</p>

			<p>The Authority includes the Diocese in most discussions – more than any other statutory body with which they are obliged to consult. A representative from the Diocese has been a full member of the Catchment Area Review Panel, the Schools Reorganisation Improvement Working Party (representing elected members of every political party), a member of the Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee and has worked with and discussed widely with the relevant officers throughout the informal discussion period (from 2010) and the statutory consultation on this proposal.</p>
9.12	<p>Prospective parents were not included in the consultation if their child was in a local nursery rather than in a nursery class in one of the schools. It was noted that this is unfair because the proposal directly affects these children.</p>	1	<p>Every local nursery received a large number of copies of the statutory consultation document and clear directions to distribute to every parent and to anyone who was interested. Also a large number of additional copies were provided for every school and for the library in Dolgellau. And all the documentation – including the statutory consultation document - were posted on the Council website.</p> <p>Regarding the meetings at the affected schools, a specific invitation was extended to staff, governing bodies and parents of those schools so that the exact opinions of the particular audience could be obtained. In some schools members of the wider community attended the parents' meetings and no objection was raised by the schools or the Authority to their presence.</p>
9.13	<p>Moving forward with one side of the catchment area before the other is unfair and unacceptable. This causes problems and the schools should all be dealt with together.</p>	2	<p>During discussions in the catchment area, there was a need to look at the catchment area part by part for the following reasons:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Geographical location and travelling times • Local wish that a large school in a central location would not be supported • The Council's Reorganisation Strategy aims, especially in terms of ensuring that schools develop to be institutions which are central to community activities. • Site and building development reasons <p>It was resolved that priority should be given to the situation in the eastern side of Y Gader catchment area for the following reasons:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 4 schools in the area receive an additional sum to the customary allocation through the minimum staffing protection policy. This additional sum totals £111,616 between the four schools. • A total of £593,916 is allocated to the 4 schools in this part of Y Gader

			<p>catchment area for 2011/12. This is equivalent to £5883 per pupil on average. This varies from school to school - from £3910 (Brithdir) to £7519 (leuan Gwynedd). The average allocation for the county for this period is £3,352.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The projected numbers in three of the schools are a cause for concern. • Number of empty places (94 in total) - 43% within the 4 schools or 58% not counting the situation at Ysgol Brithdir. Considering the number of empty places at leuan Gwynedd, Llanfachreth and Dinas Mawddwy schools, this means that there are more empty places than there are pupils attending the schools. • Ysgol Brithdir is over its capacity.(there are 45 pupils in a school with a capacity for 38) • Ysgol Dinas Mawddwy is geographically isolated and provides education for a wide area. • Also, at the time there was uncertainty regarding the leadership situation at two of the schools due to staff turnover. <p>There was a clear case and a need for long term stability for the education provision in the rural area in this part of the catchment area.</p>
9.14	Disappointed with the lack of support from the two local councillors.	1	
9.15	Discontented that the observations of the CRP are not included in their entirety in the statutory consultation report or in the large document namely the Report to the Board. The full observations of the CRP emphasised the strengths of Ysgol leuan Gwynedd.	2	<p>All the observations/minutes of the CRP meetings and the SWOT (Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats) analyses were included in full within detailed reports to the Council Board on 14/07/11. Indeed, there are two different copies of SWOT analyses to be viewed, namely SWOT analysis by CRP members and then another SWOT analysis by the Authority.</p> <p>In addition, a summary of the all these observations was included in the statutory consultation document and also included were reference points to the documentation which coincides with the summary. For practical reasons, it would have been unreasonable to include all of the bulk information in the consultation document.</p> <p>All the information, along with the minutes of the CRP meetings, the SWOT analysis, Board reports are, and have been available on the Council website and in the local Library in Dolgellau and the 4 schools etc</p> <p>It is true that the process of reviewing educational provision does cause uncertainty</p>
9.16	The consultation proposes to close Ysgol Llanfachreth on	1	

	account of the numbers, the fact that the threat of closure has been over us for years has not helped in this matter.		within an area. Even so, considering the situation at the school for several years, and even before schools reorganisation discussions , the pattern of a decline in numbers has existed and has been a cause for concern. Ysgol Brithdir was under the same threat during the same period, but the likely effect has not become apparent – indeed the exact opposite has happened and an increase in numbers has been seen.
9.17	The facts on pupil numbers, location of homes and schools and any differences should be available for all parents, governors, school staff and local members.		These details are available in full in a comprehensive information pack which is available at each one of the schools and on the Council website (direct address: http://www.gwynedd.gov.uk/gwy_doc.asp?cat=7329&doc=25330&Language=2); in local libraries and provided for every local member. These have been a basis for developing proposals in the CRP meetings and through the entire process. Details on how to obtain this documentation is available on page 3 and in point 1.10 of the statutory consultation document regarding this proposal. This underpinning information was used throughout the statutory consultation paper.
9.18	The cost of extending, rebuilding and transport should be available for everyone so that fair comparisons can be made.		This information is available on page 25 (point 5.10.2) of the statutory consultation document and is also available in the Council Board report dated 11/10/11 on the Council website. There is very detailed information in the documentation referred to in the previous point (9.17).
9.19	The answers to some questions are ambiguous, stating that many matters would be “ the responsibility of the governing body”. Explicit guidance should be provided for the new governing body in order to help the governing body to make decisions and offer clear guidance.		There is reference to the role of the governing body within 3 points in the statutory consultation document. The Authority assists the governing bodies in carrying out their duties. The points in the statutory consultation document state that this would continue, especially in the case of matters relevant to this proposal. The role of a school’s governing body is laid down by law and the Authority has no power over those matters as is explained in the statutory consultation document . The Authority would give the customary assistance to any governing body as it implements the statutory requirements expected of it. These are the points in the consultation document which show the duties and responsibilities that lie on the shoulders of the governing bodies: “7.2 If the proposal were implemented, and looking at the projected numbers at the schools, it is likely that there would be a budget for 5 primary teachers (full time) for the entire Area School. The exact nature of the collaboration and staff sharing between the two school sites is a matter to be further discussed and a matter which would need to be deliberated by the Area School Governing Body. The school will be a new entity,

			and therefore a new Governing Body will need to be established together with a instrument of governance following current guidelines and regulations. The new Governing Body will need to appoint the Head teacher and staff for the school.”
			7.5.2 In establishing the school, the Governing Body will be expected to appoint staff for the school. With regard to this process, the Council Personnel Service will be available to give help and support to the Governing Body and the staff.
			7.7.3 7.7.3 When the new Area School is established it will be necessary to establish a new Governing Body, school constitution and appoint staff. The staffing structure will be a matter for the school's Governing Body. However, the Council suggests that the Area School should earmark the posts which emerge from implementing the new system, in the first place for teachers who work within the four schools, and then those at other schools within Y Gader catchment area.
9.20	The consultation document ignores the fact that there is a Church School close by which could take the Ysgol Machreth catchment area and offer a place to each one of the pupils who attend Ysgol Machreth at present		The Statutory consultation document in part 5.1.1.2 deals with the choice that parents have in terms of continuing to receive education in a neighbouring religious school if this were their wish. If the Authority received an application from the parent of a pupil who lives within the Ysgol Machreth catchment area it would be possible to consider the option of attending the proposed area school or Ysgol Gynradd Dolgellau under exactly the same terms according to the wishes of the parent.
10	General		
10.1	Perhaps there is no need for detailed information in the consultation document on how the multi-site area school will operate at practical level but it is likely that the numbers on the two sites will be unequal and that close attention will have to be given to matters such as teachers working on the two sites and bringing pupils together for physical education and other experiences (perhaps travelling distance will be a hindrance to this)		It is predicted that in 2013 there will be around 78 pupils attending the Brithdir site of the area school and that around 23 will attend the Dinas Mawddwy site. From time to time, opportunities will arise for bringing pupils together for specific activities, and it is foreseen that pupils will benefit more from the expertise of a larger number of teachers and that expertise could be shared with a larger number of pupils.
10.2	Have taken part in the CRP discussions and the proposal put forward makes best sense.		
10.3	Proposal for the benefit of the children in the catchment		The proposal is being developed to take into consideration the number of pupils likely

	area rather than discussions on how to attract pupils from outside the catchment area			to be attending the 4 schools in accordance with the predictions of the schools themselves.
10.4	Agree with reorganisation of schools but the best possible resources must be secured for the future.			The proposal will develop a site at Ysgol Brithdir with a building fit for teaching and learning in the 21st Century.
10.5	Look into the future with confidence and support this proposal, we cannot lose this opportunity to obtain rural education of the best quality in this part of Y Gader catchment area / Hope the proposal will be successful and implemented by 31st August 2013	8		
10.6	An exciting time and I believe that the area can set an example for the rest of Gwynedd – confident that the schools can collaborate in order to ensure success.			
10.7	An area school can exist, using all the units with a shared Head Teacher, so that every school can exist with additional help – share one Head Teacher between the schools ?			Through the strategy <i>Primary Education of the Best Quality for the Children of Gwynedd</i> the Authority notes the importance of the role of the head teacher in leading and managing a school so that education of the highest quality can be ensured. In the face of this, one of the main aims of the strategy across the county is to enable head teachers to receive more time for the important task of leading and managing as – at the moment in many schools – the head teacher inevitably has to teach for extended periods at the expense of leadership and management. It is likely that it would be difficult for one head teacher to lead and manage four schools considering the workload likely to be involved with such a role. Also, it would be unacceptable to see a head teacher travelling between geographically diverse sites at the expense of leadership, management or teaching time.
10.8	What is the most important consideration for the Council? Saving money or providing education of the best standard?			Both considerations are noted in the strategy <i>Primary Education of the Best Quality for the Children of Gwynedd</i> and in considerations within the statutory consultation document. With reorganisation of schools, the Council must balance a large number of factors. Developing schools which deal with all these factors ensures that sustainable schools can be developed and maintained in order to ensure that education of the best quality can be provided.
10.9	The existing situation is not sustainable.			
10.10	Area school is a step ahead.			
10.11	Who is to say to which school parents will choose to send their children in years to come.			As a rule, parents have the choice as to which school their children will attend (provided there is room at that school).
10.12	Welcome the concept of an area school			

10.13	It is a shame that reorganisation did not happen throughout all of Y Gader catchment area at the same time	1	<p>During discussions in the catchment, it became apparent that the area would have to be looked at in stages for the following reasons:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Geographical location and travelling time • Local desire stated that a large school centralised for the whole catchment would not be supported • Site development and building reasons • The aim of the Council's Re-organisation Strategy, especially as far as ensuring the development of schools, to be establishments which are central to community events. <p>It was decided to give priority to the eastern part of Y Gader catchment for the following reasons:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 4 schools in the area receive extra funds in addition to their usual allocation because of the minimum staffing protection policy. This additional sum amounts to £111,616 between the 4 schools • A total of £593,916 was allocated to the 4 schools in this part of Y Gader catchment in 2011/12. This equates to £5883 per pupil on average. The variation between the schools ranges from £3910 (Brithdir) to £7519 (Ieuan Gwynedd). The County average for this period is £3,352 • Projected pupil numbers in 3 of the schools are a cause for concern • A number of surplus places (94 in total) – 43% within 4 schools or 58% without taking Brithdir school into consideration. This means, by considering the surplus places in Ieuan Gwynedd, Llanfachreth and Dinas Mawddwy schools, there are more surplus places than children attending the schools • Brithdir school is over capacity (45 pupils in a school with a capacity for 38) • Dinas Mawddwy school is geographically vast and provides education for a vast area • In addition, at the time there was uncertainty about the leadership of 2 schools as a result of staff turnover <p>There was a clear case and need to ensure long term security in the educational provision in this rural part of the catchment.</p>
10.14	The local member's comments should be ignored.	2	<p></p>

10.15	<p>A Petition was received: “Petition against the proposal for the reorganisation within the cathmnet area’s schools – Brithdir, Dinas Mawddwy, Ieuan Gwynedd and Ysgol Machreth, which will result in the closure of Ysgol Machreth on 31 August, 2013”</p>	1	<p>When receiving petitions the Welsh Government and the Council will consider guidance from Circular 029/2009 and “Law, Regulations and Guidance on School Organisation In Wales” where it is stated: <i>“Similarly it is a common misconception that mustering a large body of opposition will be sufficient to defeat a proposal. However a consultation is not a referendum. Strictly, those conducting the consultation should avoid giving an impression that they are offering any advanced undertaking that a local authority (or governing body) would be bound by the result of a popular vote – as this is only one of the factors that have to be taken into account in reaching the decision. The cogency of the reasons advanced during the consultation is more important than the number of people putting them forward. Thus a 100 signature petition saying, in effect, ‘we don’t like this’ may carry less weight than a single letter that exposes a genuine flaw in the proposals.”</i></p>

Appendix 3.2

Analysis of the Children and Young People Consultation

Consultation with Children and Young People

In order to collect the opinion of the pupils of the schools affected by the proposal, the schools were given the choice to either complete a special questionnaire, created by a children and young people facilitator, or have a session with a specialist children and young people facilitator.

All the schools decided to complete the questionnaire and return them to the Education Department. It was explained to the children that a change could occur and their opinion was asked about this. The following questions were asked:







- 1) How do you feel about this?
- 2) Does anything about this concern you?
- 3) What are you looking forward to most?
- 4) What are the most important things for you in a school?

Ysgol Brithdir (Headteacher has written the responses for KSI pupils)			
	Age	Comments	Number of Comments
I. How do you feel about this?	Infant Class Reception Class (Years 1 and 2)	☺ The children were delighted with the idea of creating an area school at Brithdir. They were very excited about it.	KSI responses
	Years 3,4,5,6	<div style="text-align: center;">☺ ☺ ☹</div> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Looking forward to getting a new school. 4 2. Happy that Brithdir is being developed into a larger school. 4 3. Happy that we're getting a new extension and a playing field. 3 4. Happy that we're getting a new hall and four classrooms. 2 5. Not sure about the change as i like the school as it is and i also like the school's name. 2 6. I'm happy with the school as it is – not too big not too small. 2 7. Looking forward to getting a more modern school. 2 8. Looking forward to making new friends, but also to keep the old ones. 1 	13 5 0

		<p>9. I'm unsure about how things will turn out.</p> <p>10. Looking forward to getting wooden play equipment.</p> <p>11. Looking forward to getting more teachers.</p> <p>12. I'm really excited.</p> <p>13. Looking forward to getting more space.</p> <p>14. What will be the name of the new school?</p>	<p>1</p> <p>1</p> <p>1</p> <p>1</p> <p>1</p> <p>1</p>
2.Does anything about this concern you?	Infant Class Reception Class (Years 1 and 2)	No response given	
	Years 3,4,5,6	<p>1. Losing friends</p> <p>2. Eager to keep the character of the school at Brithdir</p> <p>3. Eager that older and younger children are not separated during playtime</p> <p>4. Concerned that there won't be enough money</p> <p>5. Concerned that the new school won't be big enough</p> <p>6. Nothing</p> <p>7. Concerned that our close family unit will disband</p> <p>8. Unsure about being in a bigger school with more children</p> <p>9. I like small classes</p> <p>10. Don't want children to be unfriendly</p> <p>11. Concerned about the new children</p> <p>12. Concerned that the new classrooms will be too small</p> <p>13. Concerned that there won't be enough children to attend the new school</p>	<p>7</p> <p>6</p> <p>4</p> <p>4</p> <p>3</p> <p>3</p> <p>1</p> <p>1</p> <p>1</p> <p>1</p> <p>1</p> <p>1</p> <p>1</p>
3.What are you looking forward to most?	Infant Class Reception Class (Years 1 and 2)	<p>1. Getting a bigger school with plenty of space in each classroom</p> <p>2. Getting a field to play on with play equipment</p> <p>3. Having a purpose built cafeteria and gymnasium</p> <p>4. Having more space to play and have activities</p> <p>5. Having more friends</p>	KSI Responses

	Years 3,4,5,6	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Having a field and playground 2. New friends 3. Hall 4. Timber play equipment 5. Larger classrooms 6. More children 7. New, good teachers 8. New equipment 9. New rooms 10. Nice food 11. New name for the school 12. Heating 13. Getting a new school 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 18 12 9 8 7 5 3 3 2 2 2 1 1
4. What are the most important things for you in a school?	Infant Class Reception Class (Years 1 and 2)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Having plenty of room to play and do activities 2. Having a happy school 3. Having a playing field and play equipment 4. Having a safe car park with plenty of parking spaces 	KSI Responses
	Years 3,4,5,6	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Good education 2. Good friends 3. Good teachers 4. Good food 5. Health 6. Play area 7. Happiness 8. Plenty of space 9. Heating 10. Being friendly 11. Equipment 12. Safety 13. Large class sizes 14. Language 15. That the school has enough funds 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 18 12 12 9 6 4 4 4 4 3 2 2 1 1 1

Ysgol Dinas Mawddwy

	Age	Comments	Number of Comments
1.How do you feel about this?	Infant Class, Reception Class (Years 1 and 2)	   1. I am happy with the school like this 2. I do not want any change 3. We will have more friends 4. There will be different things after	1 6 3
	Years 3,4,5,6	  	0 6 3
2.Does anything about this concern you?	Infant Class, Reception Class (Years 1 and 2)	1. Do not want to travel far to school 2. Lose Teachers 3. Not the same resources in class	Numerical information not provided
	Years 3,4,5,6	1. New children attitude / Bullying / Losing friends / Number of new children / Naughty new children / Scared of new children 2. Get new teaching and kitchen staff 3. Children travelling further to school / Not enough space on the mini bus for all the children 4. Where will the children be when the building is being done? 5. Scared of getting lost in a big school / Noise in a big school 6. Community ruined	6 5 5 3 3 1
3.What are you looking forward to most?	Infant Class Reception Class (Years 1 and 2)	1. Playing with new friends 2. If getting a new class, seeing the inside of it	Numerical information not provided
	Years 3,4,5,6	1. New friends to make bigger teams e.g. football/rugby 2. A new place and new things 3. Do not want change 4. New playing field 5. New Teachers / Cook / food	5 4 3 2 2

		6. More trips	1
4. What are the most important things for you in a school?	Infant Class Reception Class (Years 1 and 2)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Large outdoor playing yard 2. Playing field 3. Interesting things in the classroom 4. Being happy with friends 5. Plenty of windows to see out 6. Having lunch in a hall with big children 7. Computers 8. No traffic outside so we're safe 	Numerical information not provided
	Years 3,4,5,6	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Work / Learning / Classes / Education 2. Friends / Friendly Children / More Children / Everyone liking each other 3. Good Teachers 4. Quiet / Listening 5. Feeling Safe 6. Hall and Playing Field 	<p>9</p> <p>9</p> <p>5</p> <p>2</p> <p>1</p> <p>1</p>

Ysgol Ieuan Gwynedd			
	Age	Comments	Number of Comments
1. How do you feel about this?	Infant Class Reception Class (Years 1 and 2)	☺ ☹ ☹ 1. We enjoy playing on the iard and field at Ieuan Gwynedd	1 0 3
	Years 3,4,5,6	☺ ☹ ☹ 1. Happy enough	3 4 1
2. Does anything about this concern you?	Infant Class Reception Class (Years 1 and 2)	1. Scared – don't like new situations 2. Likes stability 3. Concerned about the road as it is dangerous 4. Concerned where the taxi's will park 5. Everyone is concerned about who will be teaching them	KSI responses
	Years 3,4,5,6	1. Bullying by other children 2. Our parents will have to take us in the car, we won't be able to cycle to school 3. We want all the staff at Ieuan Gwynedd to come to Brithdir 4. Children will be bossy and not play fair 5. New, unkind teacher 6. Not much land	4 2 1 1 1 1
3. What are you looking forward to most?	Infant Class Reception Class (Years 1 and 2)	1. Making new friends	KSI responses
	Years 3,4,5,6	1. New friends 2. Normal teacher 3. Large comfortable school 4. New books 5. New work	8 1 1 1 1
4. What are the most important things for you in a school?	Infant Class Reception Class (Years 1 and 2)	1. To be happy in the new school 2. Nice teachers 3. A big iard 4. Plenty of room to play	KSI responses
	Years 3,4,5,6	1. Plenty of room to play 2. Choice of food	6 5

		3. Plenty of computers	5
		4. Play equipment	4
		5. Garden	4
		6. Funloving teachers	2
		7. Plenty of rooms	2
		8. Good teachers	2
		9. Plenty of toilets	1
		10. Plenty of books	1
		11. Plenty of desks	1
		12. Teachers to teach timestables	1
		13. Coloured paper	1
		14. Plenty of teachers	1
		15. Separate rooms	1

Ysgol Machreth

(Questionnaire completed by Headteacher summarising the responses of the whole school)

	Age	Comments	Number of Comments
1.How do you feel about this?	Whole school response	☹ 1. Why close Machreth and leave Brithdir and Dinas Mawddwy open 2. It would have been nice to have my brother attend Machreth school with me 3. Its sad seeing our school close 4. The school has been here for a long time and we don't want to move	22 pupils currently enrolled with Machreth school
2.Does anything about this concern you?	Whole school response	1. Its not fair that we won't have year 6 in Machreth 2. Bullying because of more children 3. What are they going to do with the building? 4. What if we don't like the new school? 5. Maybe i'll have to move again 6. Mrs Williams' job	22 pupils currently enrolled with Machreth school
3.What are you looking forward to most?	Whole school response	1. NOTHING 2. More children, maybe too much 3. New friends 4. More space 5. More year 6 pupils which might be good for Y Gader secondary school	22 pupils currently enrolled with Machreth school
4.What are the most important things for you in a school?	Whole school response	1. Good education in order to get a good job 2. Kind children and adults 3. Experiences 4. Not much fuss – no big events 5. Friends 6. Nobody horrible with others 7. Enjoyment – being as one big family	22 pupils currently enrolled with Machreth school